



THE ACADEMIC SENATE FOR CALIFORNIA COMMUNITY COLLEGES

POSITION PAPER

Effective and Equitable Transfer Practices in the California Community Colleges

ADOPTED FALL 2020



TRANSFER, ARTICULATION AND STUDENT SERVICES COMMITTEE 2019-2020

Sam Foster, ASCCC South Representative, Chair

Anna Bruzzese, ASCCC South Representative

Jose Lara, Rio Hondo College

Lorraine Burnham-Levy, San Jose City College

Mark Osea, Bakersfield College

Miles Vega, Porterville College

TABLE OF CONTENTS

| | |
|---|----|
| Introduction | 1 |
| Legislative Mandates | 2 |
| SB 1415 (Brulte, 2004) | 2 |
| SB 1440 (Padilla, 2010) | 3 |
| SB 440 (Padilla, 2013) | 3 |
| Other Important Considerations | 4 |
| The Value and Benefits of Transferring from a Community College | 4 |
| A Prescribed Path and Transfer Guarantee | 4 |
| Equity and Transfer | 4 |
| Students from Minoritized Groups and Intersectionality | 5 |
| Roles and Responsibilities in Supporting and Promoting Student Transfer | 6 |
| The Role of the College | 6 |
| The Role of Support Services in Transfer | 7 |
| Counseling and Advising | 7 |
| Disability Support Services | 7 |
| Learning Communities | 7 |
| How Instructors Can Help Promote Transfer | 8 |
| The Role of the Articulation Officer | 10 |
| The Role of the Local Academic Senate | 10 |
| Equipping Students for Transfer Success | 11 |
| Current Transfer Partnerships in the CCC System | 12 |
| Associate Degrees for Transfer to the California State University System | 12 |
| UC Transfer Pathways | 12 |
| University of California Transfer Admission Guarantees | 12 |
| MOU Enhancing Student Transfer | 13 |
| UC Pathways+ | 13 |
| Pilot UC Transfer Degrees | 13 |
| Historically Black Colleges and Universities | 14 |
| The ADT Commitment: Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities | 14 |
| Private Universities | 14 |
| Transfer Within the California Community Colleges' Baccalaureate Programs | 15 |
| ADT Development | 15 |
| Aligning ADTs with UC Transfer Pathways | 17 |
| Discipline Faculty Role in Transfer Path Alignment | 18 |
| Strengthening the Transfer Paths | 18 |
| Recruitment and Onboarding Within a Guided Pathways Framework | 18 |
| Leveraging Counseling | 19 |
| Transfer Centers | 19 |
| ASSIST, the Role of Counseling Faculty, and the Role of Discipline Faculty | 21 |
| External Exams (AP, IB, CLEP, Credit for Prior Learning) | 22 |

| | |
|---|----|
| Challenges | 22 |
| Recommendations for Local Academic Senates | 24 |
| Recommendations for Colleges | 24 |
| Recommendations for the Board of Governors | 24 |
| References | 25 |
| Appendices | 26 |
| Transfer Center Directors Recommended Essential Duties | 26 |
| Counseling Faculty Recommended Essential Duties | 28 |
| Classified Staff Recommended Essential Duties | 29 |
| Educational Planning Tools | 29 |
| The Associate Degrees for Transfer Approved as of Fall 2019 | 30 |
| The Twenty Majors in the UC Transfer Pathways | 31 |
| The Majors in the UC Pathways+ | 31 |

INTRODUCTION

As the California Community Colleges system strives to meet the needs of students, one important part of its mission is transfer, as this goal is the one most identified by community college students. In order to address the needs and goals of so many students, community colleges throughout the state must provide resources that can guide students through the process. Transfer should command considerable attention at community colleges for a number of reasons.

Title 5 §51027 requires that “the governing board of each community college district shall recognize transfer as one of its primary missions, and shall place priority emphasis on the preparation and transfer of underrepresented students, including African-American, Chicano/Latino, American Indian, disabled, low-income and other students historically and currently underrepresented in the transfer process.” Embedded in this Title 5 section are equity considerations. Community colleges are required to place emphasis on underrepresented students, and since these students make up the largest percentage of community college students throughout the state, effectively serving the transfer needs of the student population will partially fulfill the mandate of Title 5. Additional strategies and interventions are required for minoritized populations.

This paper is written in part as a response to Academic Senate for California Community Colleges Resolution 4.01 Spring 2018, which stated,

Whereas, California Education Code, Title 5 regulations, local policies and procedures, and restrictions placed on colleges by the California State University (CSU), the University of California (UC), independent institutions, and out-of-state institutions result in a wide variety of transfer practices and standards around the state leading to confusion among colleges as well as the exclusion and inequitable treatment of transfer-bound students across the system; and

Whereas, The Academic Senate for California Community Colleges has numerous resolutions in support of transfer opportunities for students such as Resolution 4.01 F17 “Support Students Transferring to UC, CSU, and Private and Out-of-State Institutions”;

Resolved, That the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges develop a paper identifying effective practices around transfer to assist colleges to create and apply uniform and equitable transfer policies and bring the paper to the Fall 2019 Plenary Session for adoption.

The California Community Colleges system is focused on removing barriers to a college education and providing a wide array of opportunities for underrepresented students throughout the state. The California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office *Vision for Success* lists as one of its goals that the system will “Over five years, increase by 35% the number of California Community College students transferring annually to a UC or CSU.” This goal is critical in order for California to meet demand of an educated workforce and close the equity gap created by systemic barriers. Equity in a transfer world involves removing barriers in transfer pathways, aligning curriculum across the California Community

Colleges, the University of California, and California State University systems, and successfully supporting students from underrepresented backgrounds to achieve their goal of transfer.

Legislative Mandates

Several pieces of legislation since 2004 had significant impact on how colleges prepare students for transfer.

SB 1415 (Brulte, 2004)

Senate Bill 1415 (Brulte, 2004) mandated that “not later than June 1, 2006, the California Community Colleges and the California State University shall adopt, and the University of California and private postsecondary institutions may adopt, a common course numbering system for the 20 highest-demand majors in the respective segments.” Course numbering systems across the state vary not only from system to system but from college to college. The legislature saw a common course numbering system as a means to “provide for the effective and efficient progression of students within and among the higher education segments and to minimize duplication of coursework.” However, institutions of higher education in California were reluctant to change their course numbering for multiple reasons, including the confusion doing so would have created on student transcripts and college records.

The existence of a statewide common course numbering system is not uncommon outside of California. By the early 1990s, Texas had established the Texas Common Course Numbering System. Even earlier, in the 1970s, Florida established the Statewide Course Numbering System, a stable system that is still in use to this day. In California, however, the establishment of a common course numbering system was elusive. Several attempts to create such a system either failed or had limited effectiveness, including the California Articulation Number (CAN) project founded in 1985 and the CSU Lower-Division Transfer Project. Finally, due to the mandate created by SB 1415, the Course Identification Numbering System (C-ID) was established in 2007.

C-ID “is a faculty-driven system that was initially developed to assign identifying designations (C-ID numbers) to significant transfer courses” (“About Us,” n.d.). C-ID descriptors undergo rigorous inter-segmental discipline review. Courses are then submitted for review to see if they meet the minimum established by the descriptor. C-ID approval means that courses are comparable to the descriptor. If two courses from different institutions are approved for the same C-ID descriptor, those courses are understood to be comparable to each other. Essentially, “C-ID [addressed] the need for a ‘common course numbers’ by providing a mechanism to identify comparable courses” (“About Us,” n.d.).

The benefit C-ID has for the articulation of courses among the CCCs, CSUs, and some of the UCs cannot be overstated. When a course is approved for a C-ID designator, that course “is comparable to a specific course ‘descriptor’ that has been developed by intersegmental discipline faculty and reviewed statewide” (California Intersegmental Articulation Council, 201, p. 15). This is significant in that intersegmental and intrasegmental articulations between subscribing institutions can be established. For students taking courses at multiple community colleges, having C-ID approval for their courses means that the receiving CCC will accept the credits they have already earned, no matter which CCC they attend. As the CSUs continue the practice of establishing articulation with CCC courses on the basis of a C-ID approval,

students know that their C-ID approved courses will earn them credit upon transfer. The conceptual framework from which C-ID was established can dispel the oft-heard protestations from students and alumni alike that their credits did not transfer or that they had to repeat some courses because the receiving institution did not accept them.

SB 1440 (Padilla, 2010)

Amid concern about the number of units students accumulate prior to transferring and about universities requiring students to repeat courses already completed at community colleges, several pieces of legislation were passed and signed into law. The most consequential of these bills was Senate Bill 1440 (Padilla, 2010). Signed into law in September 2010, SB 1440, the Student Transfer Achievement Reform Act, created a new pathway framework for students wishing to transfer from a California community college to a California State University. The resulting associate degrees for transfer (ADTs), first awarded in 2011, offered significant benefits to students, including minimizing the risk that some of the units students earned would not transfer or count toward a bachelor's degree and ensuring that students would not be required to repeat the courses they had successfully completed at a CCC. In addition, the bill guaranteed admission into the CSU system, though not necessarily the CSU campus of a student's choice, with an option to complete a baccalaureate degree in a similar major in no more than 60 additional units. Due to SB 1440, students know that when they transfer, they will have junior standing and they can progress in the attainment of a baccalaureate degree. The ADTs are intended to provide a smooth transfer pathway from the CCCs to the CSUs.

Although ADTs incentivize “students to earn an associate degree while preparing for transfer to a four-year college or university,” they are meant to provide “students encouragement and support to complete their overall educational pursuits.”¹ The ADTs are intended to ensure for students a seamless transfer and completion of a baccalaureate degree.

SB 440 (Padilla, 2013)

Three years after the passage of SB 1440 to create associate degrees for transfer, the follow-up legislation SB 440 (Padilla, 2013) required community colleges “to create an associate degree for transfer in every major and area of emphasis offered by that college for any approved transfer model curriculum, as prescribed, thereby imposing a state-mandated local program.” This bill had three important impacts. First, it significantly expanded the number of ADTs developed and offered in the California Community Colleges system, as colleges were now mandated to create degrees in any area in which a statewide template existed and in which the college offered a local degree. Second, whereas the initial ADTs were focused on specific major fields, SB 440 directed the creation of broader “area of emphasis” degrees that could include several major pathways. Finally, previous to this bill, submission of any specific course for inclusion in the C-ID system had been optional for colleges. However, since the ADTs were built based on verification of C-ID descriptors and SB 440 mandated the creation of ADTs in most transfer disciplines offered by a college, participation in C-ID essentially became a requirement to a far greater degree than it was originally.

1 See the text of SB 1440 (Padilla, 2010) at https://leginfo.legislature.ca.gov/faces/billNavClient.xhtml?bill_id=200920100SB1440.

Other Important Considerations

While ADTs are meant to streamline transfer, often, unless students know exactly where they want to transfer upon entering the community college system, they may need to take more courses because of the difference in requirements of various institutions in the UC and CSU systems. These differences occur for a variety of reasons, including lack of alignment of degree programs where feasible, as well as significant variations in the nature of some programs across institutions.

Regardless of how one feels about the above legislation and others affecting transfer, the mere fact that these bills were created and passed is evidence of the wide-reaching concern regarding the time needed for students to transfer as well as the relatively low transfer rates, especially for minoritized student populations. Transfer is sufficiently important to the California Community Colleges Board of Governors that the *Vision for Success* adopted in 2017 specifically calls out transfer and sets an ambitious goal to increase the number of transfers to the California State Universities and the University of California by 35%. Beyond this systemwide goal, every community college is obligated to help its students reach their personal transfer goals, whether to the UC, the CSU, or another institution.

As of 2019, nearly half of students earning a bachelor's degree from a University of California campus in science, technology, engineering, and mathematics transferred from a California community college. In addition, 29% of University of California graduates and 51% of California State University graduates started at a community college (California Community College Chancellor's Office, n.d.).

THE VALUE AND BENEFITS OF TRANSFERRING FROM A COMMUNITY COLLEGE

A Prescribed Path and Transfer Guarantee

Even before the broad-based adoption of a guided pathways framework, colleges provided specific guidance to students who sought transfer to four-year institutions. The creation of associate degrees for transfer mandated by SB 1440 (Padilla, 2010) further established clear and consistent guidance for students regarding transfer to the CSU system. Through not only the ADTs but also a variety of other transfer agreements, students who completed appropriate coursework and met the qualifying grade point average could be guaranteed admission to many four-year institutions. While guaranteed admission is not available at every institution or in every major, this option remains attractive for many students, especially students who may be concerned that a four-year institution is not for them.

Equity and Transfer

Community colleges can help to address transfer equity issues in a number of ways. For students who traditionally were not considered academically college-ready, starting at a community college provides an opportunity to begin their college careers and improve both their knowledge and their confidence on

their way to a bachelor's degree. For students not socially or emotionally prepared for a university and the freedoms that come with traditional college life, community colleges often provide more support services. Because of the number of community colleges in California, students who are place-bound due to family or other obligations can begin their education without having to leave home. In each of these ways, community colleges can offer more equitable assistance and opportunities to some of the state's most underserved or vulnerable populations.

Transfer centers offer critical equity programs to assist students from underrepresented backgrounds in achieving their educational goals. Multiple and various college programs can work with academic affairs, university representatives, community groups, and other constituencies to assist in meeting these goals, ensuring that equity is at the forefront of all decisions involving transfer.

Due to generally smaller class sizes, community college students are able to interact with instructors more easily, thus creating an environment that promotes greater equity. Furthermore, the role of community college faculty is to focus on teaching and direct personal student interaction. This type of structure can be beneficial for minoritized students and especially first-generation college students. Hence, the number of first-generation college students that graduate from the UC that originated at a community college is comparable to native UC students despite the fact that many of these community college students may not have been UC eligible upon graduation from high school (Community College League of California, 2018). Many first-generation students who are academically prepared for the university may also benefit from the more hands-on approach at the community college.

STUDENTS FROM MINORITIZED GROUPS AND INTERSECTIONALITY

Colleges should recognize the specific needs of students from minoritized groups regarding the transfer process. These groups include first generation college students as well as students of color.

In supporting minoritized students, colleges must be mindful of the intersectionality of students in that they may be a part of multiple minoritized communities. One community that particularly encapsulates other minoritized students is the LGBTQ+ community. For example, 70% of LGBTQ+ students in the California Community College system identify as people of color.² In addition, LGBTQ+ people are overrepresented among foster youth, with the majority of those being people of color (Children's Bureau, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, 2014), 40% of homeless youth are LGBT (Durso & Gates, 2012), and this population is more likely to be low income with nearly 27% of LGB adults 18-44 on SNAP compared to 20% of non LGB adults in the same age range (Brown, Williams Institute, & Romero, 2016). One campus reported that 19% of students visiting its food pantry identified as LGBTQ+. These statistics illustrate that supporting LGBTQ+ students is simultaneously supporting other minoritized groups. Colleges should be mindful of the difficulties faced by all minoritized groups of students and the ways in

² Data obtained from a California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office study. Gobuyan, A. C. (2018). LGBTQ+ Students at California Community Colleges.

which they intersect. The development of initiatives and programs promoting transfer should always include a consciousness of specific efforts to address the needs of such students.

ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES IN SUPPORTING AND PROMOTING STUDENT TRANSFER

The Role of the College

The community college has a responsibility to work with students to help them reach their goals. This statement is certainly true with regard to transfer. Since students enter college with a wide range of skills and needs, colleges must find ways to engage students who list transfer as a goal along their educational path. This process requires serving the diverse needs of students through an equitable use of the limited resources available, including leveraging existing resources where possible. While the students themselves must also play an important role in their ultimate success, many of the structures of the college shoulder much of the responsibility to engage and support the students. From the local academic senate, to the instructors and services designed to support instruction and student success, the college must take inventory of the roles it plays in helping students meet their transfer goals.

The Research and Planning Group of the California Community Colleges conducted a study of students who list transfer as their primary goal. The study, titled “Through the Gate,” indicates that a significant number of students who list transfer as their goal do not make it through the transfer gate, including a significant number who are already at the gate—having met the requirements to transfer—or near the gate, meaning that they have enough units to transfer but are missing transferable mathematics, English, or both (Research and Planning Group, 2019). The study further finds that some students do not persist long enough to approach the transfer requirements, resulting in lower transfer rates for these groups. A variety of reasons were cited for students at the gate yet not transferring, such as demographics and regional factors, including lack of access to their local UC or CSU campus. While some of these factors may be out of the immediate control of a community college, colleges must work to address the situations of students who are near the gate but do not transfer as well as those who list transfer as a goal but do not persist.

Scheduling of courses is an area in which colleges can come together to eliminate transfer barriers for students. Administration and faculty can work together to survey student needs and preferences regarding course scheduling. If the courses students need for a given major pathway are offered in a specific, consistent time block, the students can plan accordingly and commit to the pathway. In other cases, having required courses that overlap in times can delay a student’s progress and limit the number of requirements a student can fulfill in a semester. In addition, non-traditional students frequently depend on evening and weekend classes that are often affected by budget cuts. By committing to transfer pathways that include evenings and weekends, colleges could help support working students and those with family obligations. Having to piece a schedule together every term while also managing work and family commitments can be an additional barrier to students’ success and transfer goals. A scheduling process that takes into consideration transfer needs and requirements can help to minimize such a barrier.

Understanding the importance of an associate degree is a high indicator for transfer, as an associate degree is the foundation for understanding and completing bachelor's degree requirements (Henry and Knight, 2003). Colleges can assist students by providing associate degree sheets and mini lessons on the value of completing a degree to students in a variety of venues, which can help the students to see the path to transfer.

As colleges work to help students transfer who currently do not reach the gate and to improve transfer rates overall, special attention must be paid to the transfer rates of Black or African-American, Latinx, Pacific Islander, and other students that have been disproportionately underrepresented in transferring from the community college system.

The Role of Support Services in Transfer

Counseling and Advising

Academic advising at four-year institutions is often done by faculty advisors. While such advising is a valuable tool, discipline faculty do not provide the holistic approach used by most community college counselors. Counselors incorporate career exploration strategies, academic assessment tools, and personal counseling to assist students in making informed decisions about their educational pursuits.

The role of highly trained counselors is a critical component in helping students to realize their transfer potential and guiding them through the process, including helping students understand the wide variety of transfer pathways and agreements available. The importance of counselors in supporting student transfer is among the catalysts for restructuring initiatives such as guided pathways that aim to break down silos between student services and instruction. Undoubtedly, students would benefit from stronger connections between these two crucial areas of the college.

Disability Support Services

Students with disabilities can face additional and unique obstacles in their efforts to transfer. The transfer process is challenging, especially if a student's disability may impact the completion of a transfer requirement. Disability Support Services provide a wide range of assistance for such students. For example, a student with a learning disability may have difficulty in completing the quantitative reasoning requirement and may require support and advocacy from Disability Support Services. In order for students with disabilities to have success in the transfer process, a strong relationship must be established among community colleges' Disability Support Services and the Disability Support Services at four-year institutions.

Learning Communities

Studies have consistently demonstrated that being part of a cohort benefits students in achieving their academic goals, whether those goals are skills acquisition, transfer, or a terminal degree for career preparation or advancement. Throughout the California Community Colleges system, programs exist that have demonstrated positive impact on traditionally underrepresented or marginalized groups through the use of cohorts. An example of one such program is Umoja. The Umoja Program is designed

to assist African-American and other historically underrepresented students, and students enrolled in the program outperform similar students not enrolled in several key areas according to a 2018 study of the 2011-2014 cohorts.³ Similarly, retention rates from fall to fall were also much better for each Umoja cohort versus non-Umoja students, with the rates of program students nearly twice those of non-Umoja students by the year two (Messier, Institute for Social Research, Williams, Hall, & Visueta, 2018, p.40). Completion rates, including associate degrees and certificates, were also enhanced for the Umoja group.

Other targeted programs such as Puente show significant improvement in transfer rates (Messier, Institute for Social Research, Williams, Hall, & Visueta, 2018; The Puente Project, n.d.). These programs share some significant components, including employing high-impact practices and providing culturally relevant experiences integrated throughout. Additionally, colleges may take advantage of Federal Institutional Service grants to serve groups that were historically underserved and have equity gaps in student success. These grants typically require colleges to have a certain percentage of their student body represented by these targeted groups. Examples of these federal grants include Asian-American and Native American Pacific Islander-Serving Institutions, Hispanic Serving Institutions, and Predominantly Black Institutions. California community colleges have successfully received these grants to fund the creation of coordinated instructional and student services cohorts to serve these student populations. Such efforts may be in parallel or in tandem with other programs such as Puente and Umoja. Many colleges have created their own cohort programs for disproportionately impacted students, which may include a variety of practices similar to those found in the programs previously mentioned. Colleges must consider leveraging such practices to serve a larger population of disproportionately impacted students, including historically underserved and marginalized populations, in order to increase the number of students who successfully complete their stated academic goals and eliminate barriers to transfer.

How Instructors Can Help Promote Transfer

At many colleges, a high student-to-counselor ratio underscores the essential role of discipline faculty, who interact with students daily, in helping students persist, complete, and transfer. While discipline faculty cannot replace the function of trained counselors, they can assist with and support student transfer in a variety of ways.

One of the best ways instructors can promote transfer is to directly encourage students in their classes to consider transferring. Some students may doubt their ability to transfer to a four-year college or university, and the positive support of an instructor can help them reframe their self-concept. A strong correlation exists between self-esteem and self-efficacy. Genuinely expressing one's belief in a student's ability to succeed may significantly impact the student's future by providing validation that an educational goal of transfer is viable. Instructors are on the front line and can create real change.

Faculty should continuously reflect on the curriculum and its delivery and implement changes that optimize student success and transfer. In addition to staying current in their disciplines and being aware of changes to the larger educational environment, instructors should take advantage of culturally

³ A student enters a cohort in the year they first enroll and are followed throughout their enrollment in the system.

responsive training and other similar equity and anti-racism infused professional development programs to stay current on the most effective teaching and mentoring practices. The importance of creating an encouraging environment based on high academic expectations and authentic care for students' well-being cannot be understated in terms of its impact on students' ability to succeed. When faculty create an environment where transfer is seen as expected and attainable, an in-class transfer culture is created.

Transferring to a four-year institution may be difficult or seem impossible or insurmountable to some community college students. Professors can encourage transfer students by sharing their lived experiences and personal educational journey. Hearing about the struggles their instructors faced in college and seeing a positive outcome may help to instill confidence and decrease anxiety for some students. A large number of community college faculty are products of community colleges themselves. These instructors understand the process and can pass this information along to their students. Many faculty members have personal contacts or specific knowledge about a CSU or UC that also may benefit students. Thus, sharing personal experiences and stories not only provides emotional support but also can help students understand the intricacies of the college process. First generation students and others unfamiliar with transfer can glean insights that may help them navigate the transition from a two-year college to a four-year institution more efficiently. In this way, faculty can help create a transfer culture.

Whether designated as a faculty advisor or not, faculty can assume that role as it relates to transfer and career exploration. Faculty using office hours to meet with students about the transfer process can benefit students greatly while providing systematic exploration as opposed to blind trial and error class selection. Sharing specific information about the discipline and discussing expectations, industry standards, and other aspects of the field can help students transition.

Another effective way to promote transfer is to announce or share transfer activities in class. Students may not see bulletin boards or social media posts, but classroom faculty have consistent contact with students and have the ability to share information about transfer. Along with the announcements, faculty can also encourage students to meet with representatives from four-year institutions and hopefully develop a relationship with them.

Because contact between classroom faculty and students is frequent, thus providing more time for information to be shared, discipline faculty can use this opportunity to increase awareness of transfer resources such as ASSIST and C-ID. Whether an instructor links transfer sites to a class webpage or mentions them in class, having the information widely available is helpful. Some colleges may also allow counseling faculty to make guest presentations on transfer. Where this option is available, classroom faculty may consider scheduling such presentations in order to ensure that students are receiving accurate information on transfer and have an opportunity to ask questions of a counselor.

Faculty members should also engage students in understanding the importance of networking and relationship building as they complete their degrees. Faculty should inform students that references and letters of recommendation are vital when applying to scholarships, four-year university admission, and research opportunities. Some tips that faculty members may share with students are the following:

- Establish a relationship with the instructor that includes going to office hours.
- Offer to share a resume when asking for a letter or reference.
- Ask multiple instructors for letters of recommendation.
- Inform the instructor of any deadlines for sending letters and provide ample lead time to assure the deadline can be met.

These recommendations may help students develop social and academic capital during their educational journeys. Faculty may also help students by sharing a sample personal statement that was submitted to colleges or for scholarships.

Finally, faculty members should be available and willing to submit recommendations for students who have completed their classes. Writing a letter of recommendation or serving as reference can make a difference in the students' journeys to accomplish their goals.

The Role of the Articulation Officer

The role of the articulation officer (AO) in the implementation of transfer coursework is very significant. AOs provide oversight and input regarding their colleges' transferable courses to the CSU and UC systems, general education (CSU GE Breadth and IGETC), and C-ID aligned courses. When faculty develop or revise their transferable curricula, AOs ensure that the courses align with the CSU and UC regulations and standards.

In the development of ADTs, articulation officers are vital consultants to the faculty. From articulation agreements by major, baccalaureate course lists, and general education certified courses, AOs can best guide the faculty as to how their courses can be included in their ADTs.

The articulation officer is crucial in the maintenance of any college's articulation agreements with the CSUs, UCs, historically Black colleges and universities, independent California colleges and universities, private four-year universities, and out-of-state universities. AOs liaise with potential partner institutions in the establishment of transfer agreements and memorandums of understanding (MOUs). Upon initial contact, AOs facilitate conversations between department chairs, deans, and vice presidents in the negotiation finalization of a transfer MOU.

The Role of the Local Academic Senate

For a college to meet the needs of its diverse students, local academic senates must play a vital role in both the development and the implementation of initiatives related to student persistence, completion, and transfer. As Title 5 §53200 specifies, academic senates' primary function is to make recommendations with respect to academic and professional matters, including several areas that are directly linked to

students' ability to achieve transfer goals such as curriculum, educational program development, and standards or policies regarding student preparation and success.

Local academic senates, as well as appropriate academic senate committees, task forces, other groups, and representatives, should be actively involved in transfer education discussions regarding analyzing relevant trends, generating recommendations, creating plans and programs, and monitoring program implementation. Local senates should encourage, engage in, examine, and utilize disaggregated data to make informed decisions related to student transfer. Such data is helpful in determining and addressing equity concerns regarding transfer rates and developing initiatives and programs that equitably promote and support student transfer. The academic senate also plays an important part in advocating for adequate resources such as funding for programs and activities.

Moreover, academic senates play a critical role in promoting the broader professional development of faculty, including the development of an understanding of barriers to transfer and classroom strategies for removing such barriers and helping students reach their transfer goals. To this end, academic senates should have access to research, data, and funding to support the professional development needs of the college in the area of transfer education.

EQUIPPING STUDENTS FOR TRANSFER SUCCESS

When students choose transfer as their educational goal, the college has a responsibility to provide guidance and support to help them reach that goal. This support is especially important for minoritized students, including African-American, Latinx, American Indian, disabled, low-income, first generation, and other students historically and currently underrepresented in the transfer process. These students may be unfamiliar with their options, the transfer process, and the timelines involved.

Community college students have a variety of options for transferring to four-year institutions. If the student opts to remain in California, there are 23 campuses in the California State University system, nine campuses in the University of California system, and over 100 private or independent colleges and universities. As a part of orientation, students should be introduced to the college transfer center and the services and support offered. The college matriculation process should proactively provide students interested in transfer with information and access to transfer center services as early as possible, assisting students in learning all the nuts and bolts of the transfer process to make informed choices on their educational goals.

Transfer centers in the community colleges offer a wide variety of services that include but are not limited to transfer exploration, college tours, access to four-year institution representatives, transfer fairs, transfer conferences, meetings with transfer counselors, and computers to access information. Once a student has made an informed choice on a major and four-year institutions, the student should be encouraged to meet with a transfer counselor to create an updated educational plan and discuss strategies to have a successful transfer process.

CURRENT TRANSFER PARTNERSHIPS IN THE CCC SYSTEM

The pathway to a four-year degree is facilitated through many different programs that target underrepresented students in the community college system. Various initiatives and partnerships with four-year institutions help students to transition between two-year and four-year schools. Though still not seamless, such partnerships encourage and facilitate transfer from CCCs to CSUs, UCs, and other four-year institutions.

Associate Degrees for Transfer to the California State University System

With the adoption of SB 1440 (Padilla) in 2010, the associate degree for transfer was created as a transfer pathway articulated between California Community Colleges and the California State University. A student graduating with an associate in arts for transfer or an associate in science for transfer in one of the 36 ADT majors is guaranteed admission into the CSU system in a similar major, with junior standing, and the opportunity to finish a baccalaureate degree in no more than 60 additional units. In addition to guaranteed admission, students that are admitted to a CSU campus using an ADT cannot be required to repeat any coursework completed at a community college after transfer. ADTs are aligned to transfer model curricula that are developed and agreed upon by discipline faculty from the CSUs and CCCs.

UC Transfer Pathways

The UC Transfer Pathways (UCTP) program established a common set of major preparation requirements for all UC campuses that could be communicated to prospective transfer students. With each of the campuses in the UC system agreeing on the courses outlined in each transfer pathway, students only have to follow a single course pattern to be prepared to transfer to multiple UC campuses. Pathways were established in the 20 most popular majors and are designed to provide clear, consistent course-taking advice for students and to satisfy UC campus admission requirements across the entire system for a specific major. Although the UCTP addresses academic preparation, it does not provide any admission guarantees.

University of California Transfer Admission Guarantees

Transfer admission guarantees (TAGs) are currently available in some majors at six UC campuses: Irvine, Riverside, Merced, Santa Cruz, Davis, and Santa Barbara. A TAG outlines specific course and GPA requirements that students must complete in order to receive guaranteed admission. A student is only permitted to apply for one TAG, must meet the TAG application deadline, currently September 30, and must also apply for UC transfer admission by the UC application deadline, currently November 30.

TAG requirements vary by major and by UC campus, and they do not always align with the University of California Transfer Pathways. This situation may cause some confusion for students who are guaranteed admission to a UC campus because they completed a TAG but may not be prepared to begin junior level courses if they did not also complete the UCTP.

MOU Enhancing Student Transfer

Signed in April of 2018, a memorandum of understanding between the University of California Office of the President and the California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office outlines a series of activities in an effort to increase the number of qualified students transferring from the CCC system to the UC system. The goal of this agreement is to grant access and timely completion to CCC students. In addition, the UC established a Transfer Pathway+ program that guarantees admission to students. The establishment of a guaranteed admission program was one of the activities outlined in the MOU.

UC Pathways+

UC Pathways+ combines the UC Transfer Pathways program and transfer admission guarantees to ensure admission to the UC system for specified majors⁴. In this program, students are encouraged to complete the major preparation courses outlined in the UCTP and to apply for a TAG to one of the six campuses where they are available. A TAG is not available in all of these majors at all of the UC campuses offering TAGs.

Pilot UC Transfer Degrees

The UC and the CCC system have made a concerted effort to increase transfer options for students by expanding transfer guarantees, especially in areas where an ADT that can fully prepare students has been difficult for colleges to create because of unit limitations and general education requirements. One such effort, the result of an agreement between the University of California Office of the President and the California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office, is the pilot UC transfer degrees.

As of Fall 2019, the pilot was active in chemistry and physics. While the ADT is the result of legislation, these pilot degrees were developed through a collaboration between the two systems, allowing the degrees to align with the typical course-taking pattern that would be completed by UC students during their first two years of study. For example, the ADT in physics has significant differences with the UCTP. Physics faculty from all three segments agree that the UCTP is better preparation for junior level coursework, but the ADT is not able to include all of the major preparation courses because of the 60-unit limit.

The pilot degrees will require colleges to create an associate degree that aligns with the UCTP. The CCC Chancellor’s Office has published templates similar to the ADT transfer model curricula for colleges to use. Students pursuing one of these degrees will be required to complete the UCTP requirements plus a modified general education pattern of IGETC minus four courses. Students will also be required to meet a higher GPA requirement than those of most of the available TAGs with the UC campuses.

⁴ See “Appendices” on page 26.

Historically Black Colleges and Universities

The California Community Colleges Board of Governors established a memorandum of understanding with historically Black colleges and universities (HBCUs) to guarantee admission to students that complete an associate degree for transfer. The objective of this agreement is to facilitate a smooth transition for students from all of the California community colleges to partnered HBCUs. To date, more than 35 HBCUs have signed on (“HBCU Transfer Participating HBCU,” 2019). These agreements simplify the transfer process and reduce students’ taking of unnecessary courses, thereby shortening the time to degree completion with a cost savings.

The ADT Commitment: Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities

The ADT Commitment is the Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (AICCU) sector’s adaptation of the ADT pathway. While similar to the CSU ADT program, this agreement includes some differences due to the independent nature of the state’s nonprofit institutions. For example, unlike CSU, AICCU institutions are not part of a system, and each campus has its own admission and graduation requirements. Therefore, if an ADT transfer student meets all the requirements for admission to a participating institution, admission is guaranteed only to that college as opposed to a system. The ADT Commitment guarantees admission for students meeting specific requirements, guarantees a minimum of 60 semester or 90 quarter units will transfer, and guarantees that the student will start at the transfer institution with junior standing.

Private Universities

Some private universities offer community college students transfer-friendly bachelor’s programs for a low cost once they transfer. These programs are often designated as California Community Colleges-Associate Degree for Transfer programs, which guarantees the associate in arts for transfer and associate in science for transfer degrees are fully transferable and are aligned to similar bachelor’s degrees that can generally be completed in 90 quarter units or 60 semester units or less. This opportunity is available for CCC transfer students who have recently earned their ADT, associate of arts (AA), or associate of science (AS) degree. Additional coursework beyond the 90 quarter units or 60 semester units may be required for AA and AS degree recipients depending on the school and completed coursework. These types of programs and partnerships specifically benefit community college students who are in the military or working because many of the courses are online and therefore accessible from anywhere. This situation often makes the cost of completing a bachelor’s degree lower than finishing a degree at a CSU or UC. Some private universities even offer programs that are fully on-line, geared for non-traditional learning and completion of degrees.

Transfer Within the California Community Colleges' Baccalaureate Programs

The signing of SB 850 (Block, 2014) established a baccalaureate degree pilot program for the California Community Colleges. As of Spring 2020, fifteen colleges offer unique bachelor's degree programs in technical education fields. These programs offer a new intrasegmental transfer pathway, as students can transfer from any community college with an associate's degree or certificate program that fulfills the lower division major requirements in a given field into a bachelor's degree program at a community college that offers that program.

The following programs are approved for community college baccalaureate degrees:

- Airframe Manufacturing Technology, Antelope Valley College
- Industrial Automation, Bakersfield College
- Emergency Services and Allied Health Systems, Crafton Hills College
- Mortuary Science, Cypress College
- Equine Industry, Feather River College
- Dental Hygiene, Foothill College and West Los Angeles College
- Bio-manufacturing, Mira Costa College
- Respiratory Care, Modesto Junior College and Skyline College
- Automotive Technology, Rio Hondo College
- Health Information Management, San Diego Mesa College
- Occupational Studies, Santa Ana College
- Interaction Design, Santa Monica College
- Health Information Management, Shasta College

Discussion is currently ongoing among a variety of stakeholders and legislators about expanding the number of bachelor's degrees offered at community colleges as a way to meet workforce demand and provide increased earning opportunities for workers. For example, nurses, fire fighters, and law enforcement officers who obtain a bachelor's degree after their associate's degree may receive better pay and have greater advancement opportunities.

ADT DEVELOPMENT

The creation of associate degrees for transfer with the passage of SB 1440 (Padilla 2010) opened a new transfer pathway for students to the CSU and created a challenge for the California community colleges and the CSU system to develop a systemwide implementation of these new degrees. While SB 1440 allowed for each college to develop unique ADTs, the Academic Senates of the California Community Colleges and

California State University determined that a statewide model for each degree was vital to the success of the program. The two senates determined that faculty from each system should jointly develop a template of required and elective courses that would be contained in each community college’s ADT. These transfer model curricula (TMCs) are developed, vetted, and approved by discipline faculty in the CCCs and the CSU. Once a TMC has been approved, a template is developed by the California Community Colleges Chancellor’s Office that allows community colleges to submit their ADTs for approval.

The TMC template outlines the required courses and electives permitted for each ADT. For a CCC course to be included in the TMC, it must satisfy one of four criteria, as demonstrated by the TMC for the AA-T in Anthropology, which is shown below as an example:

Associate in Arts in Anthropology for Transfer Degree
Transfer Model Curriculum (TMC)

| Course Title (units) | C-ID Descriptor |
|---|-----------------|
| REQUIRED CORE: (9 UNITS) | |
| Introduction to Biological Anthropology (3) | ANTH 110 |
| Introduction to Cultural Anthropology (3) | ANTH 120 |
| Introduction to Archaeology (3) | ANTH 150 |
| LIST A: SELECT ONE (3 UNITS) | |
| Any course articulated as lower division | AAM |
| LIST C: SELECT ONE (3 UNITS) | |
| List A or B course not already used. | |
| Any CSU transferrable Anthropology course | BCT |
| Any non-Anthropology course from the humanities or social sciences on cultural diversity. (See examples on TMC) | GECC |

Courses can be added to a TMC by meeting any of the following criteria:

1. A C-ID descriptor exists for the course and the course is C-ID approved, as with ANTH 110, ANTH 120, and ANTH 150.
2. The course is part of an articulation agreement by major, meaning that the CCC course is articulated in the lower division at a CSU, as verified by an articulation agreement on [Assist.org](https://assist.org).
3. The course is included on a general education certification course list, meaning that the CCC course aligns with the template course description and has been approved for either CSU GE Breadth or IGETC, as shown by “Any ‘non-Anthropology course from the humanities or social sciences on cultural diversity’” on the anthropology TMC.
4. The course is included on a baccalaureate course list. These courses are CSU transferable and align with the description on the TMC, such as “Any CSU transferable Anthropology course” on the anthropology TMC.

The template guarantees that faculty create AA-Ts and AS-Ts that align with the TMCs.

ALIGNING ADTS WITH UC TRANSFER PATHWAYS

Since many students may not know initially if they want to transfer to a CSU or a UC campus, students would benefit if the differences between those pathways were minimized. To facilitate this process, a transfer memo between the UC President and CCC Chancellor was agreed to and called on the UC Academic Senate to work with ASCCC to identify alignment between the UCTPs and existing transfer model curriculum (TMCs), the basis of ADTs. In some cases, the current TMC requirements are consistent with the UCTP. In these majors, alignment may simply be a matter of having the UC campuses accept the ADTs as appropriate preparation. Once these majors are identified, students can be prepared for transfer to either system by completing an ADT. Furthermore, if a guarantee can be established for students completing a UCTP, that guarantee to either system could be extended to students earning an ADT, although the GPA requirement would likely be higher for UC admission.

The ASCCC strongly advocated for alignment of CSU and UC transfer pathways where possible to facilitate student transfer to either system, for example in Resolution 15.01 F17:

Whereas, Preparing students to transfer into baccalaureate degree programs is one of the primary missions of the California community colleges;

Whereas, The majority of transfer students are transferring to either a California State University (CSU) or University of California (UC) campus, and colleges must develop courses that satisfy the expectations of and articulate to both systems;

Whereas, Associate Degrees for Transfer (ADTs) that guarantee student admission to the CSU system do not always align with the major preparation expected by UC campuses outlined in the UC Transfer Pathways (UCTP) for 21 majors; and

Whereas, The different expectations from the UC and CSU systems for transfer students often force students to choose which system they plan to transfer to, which could limit their options when they are ready to transfer;

Resolved, That the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges strongly encourage local senates and curriculum committees to maintain sufficient rigor in all courses to ensure that they will articulate for students transferring to the California State University or University of California systems; and

Resolved; That the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges work with the Academic Senates of the California State University and the University of California to identify a single pathway in each of the majors with an Associate Degree for Transfer to ensure that students will be prepared to transfer into either the California State University or the University of California systems.

Aligning transfer pathways among the California community colleges, the University of California system, and the California State Universities could have several significant positive outcomes for

community college students. Pathway alignment is critical from an equity perspective. This one tool could remove systemic barriers in advising, provide options in transferring, reduce the number of units taken by students, allow counseling faculty to provide robust counseling services, and help students from minoritized backgrounds graduate with an associate degree for transfer. Such alignment would also be consistent with another goal in the *Vision for Success*, to decrease the units that students need to complete their educational goals.

In some cases, alignment of the transfer paths will not be possible because the bachelor's degree in the CSU prepares the student for a particular career path while the UC degree prepares the student for a different path. Once a clear reason for lack of alignment is established, counselors and discipline faculty must explain these options to students so that they may choose a transfer path based on their career goals. Even when the systems do not align, specific colleges may offer similar pathways that could provide students with a number of viable transfer options. In all cases, the California Community Colleges, California State Universities, and University of California continue to work together on pathways that streamline the transfer process.

Discipline Faculty Role in Transfer Path Alignment

Discipline faculty must play a critical role in the aligning transfer paths, as this work is inherently related to curriculum. As broader conversations continue between the California community colleges and their CSU and UC partners, discipline faculty within the community college system may need to modify degrees, create new degrees that align, and in some cases consolidate course offerings. This effort will further require partnering with counseling faculty and articulation officers to address the various options, requirements, and barriers students face when pursuing their transfer goals. As important advocates for students in the transfer process, instructional faculty are instrumental in the curriculum process and in ensuring that the courses that are offered correspond to changing student needs and allow for students to maximize their transfer options.

STRENGTHENING THE TRANSFER PATHS

Recruitment and Onboarding Within a Guided Pathways Framework

In order to strengthen the transfer paths within a guided pathways framework, the recruitment stage requires faculty and staff engagement to clarify the paths for future students. Mapping out of all programs for transfer should include detailed information on target outcomes, course sequences, critical courses, and progress milestones, with math and other coursework aligned to each program of study.

The onboarding stage requires faculty and staff engagement to help students get on the path to an identified goal. Research shows that many students arrive at college without clear goals and may not have a clear idea of the opportunities that are available to them through advising and counseling services. Studies suggest that those who need these resources the most are also the least likely to take advantage of them or seek them out.

In order to support their goals of transferring, students may wish to establish a clear idea early on in their community college studies of which four-year institutions they hope to transfer to and which programs they plan to transfer into. Addressing this need can help students avoid taking additional courses to satisfy unnecessary program requirements, as often the information on transfer requirements is complicated, hard to find, and unreliable.

Of course, not all students arrive on campus prepared to make such immediate decisions, and colleges should not force students into what may feel like a commitment to choices of which they are not certain or that may ultimately restrict options. Some students may need time to explore and evaluate their choices, and thus colleges should develop educational plans that provide flexibility for students who need it.

Leveraging Counseling

Counseling is a key component in preparing students for transfer. As counselors assist students in putting together their educational plans, they may also inform students of alternative course offerings to help them meet their goals. This practice can be especially useful when limited course offerings or challenging personal schedules present difficulties for students trying to take required courses on their local campuses. Despite a college's best efforts, some students may be unable to enroll in the courses they need for transfer in a timely manner at their home institutions. This situation may occur because a specific class is offered infrequently, because the student's schedule prohibits enrolling in the courses that are needed, or because the course is not offered by the college. While some students may choose to go to another campus nearby, this option is not always available, especially in rural areas or when students have limited transportation options. In these cases, students have access to the California Virtual Campus – Online Education Initiative (CVC-OEI). CVC-OEI provides resources that can facilitate timely completion of transfer goals, especially for students who need to fulfill a general education or major requirement that their home institution is not offering during the current semester. Students and counselors can visit cvc.edu and search for California community college classes currently being offered online by general education area, major area, or keyword. Courses that have been quality reviewed and aligned with the CVC-OEI Course Design Rubric will populate to the top of the search results. Currently, only distance education courses with C-ID designations appear in the course finder.

In addition, partnerships should be maintained campus-wide so that counselors, discipline faculty, and transfer centers can work together to reach more students, encouraging pursuit of transfer and providing the information necessary to prepare students. This partnership is particularly useful since counselors have unique expertise regarding transfer infrastructure but typically can see a student once a semester or less, while discipline faculty often see students several times a week for the entire semester.

Transfer Centers

Title 5 directs each California community college governing board to recognize transfer as an important component of its college's mission and to prioritize the preparation and transfer of underrepresented

students. To help colleges accomplish this goal, transfer centers have become an integral support program for students seeking to transfer to four-year institutions.

Transfer centers provide a variety of services and assist colleges in creating a transfer culture. Among the intensive services that transfer centers provide are the following:

- Counseling Services;
- Transfer related workshops;
- Transfer fairs;
- Transfer conferences;
- Access to university representatives;
- University tours;
- University application assistance.

Transfer centers lead all components of the transfer process and are responsible for establishing relationships with other student support programs, academic affairs, community partners, and four-year or transfer institutions to educate the college community on the transfer process.

Title 5 §51027 states that transfer centers “shall place priority emphasis on the preparation and transfer of underrepresented students, including African-American, Chicano/Latino, American Indian, disabled, low-income and other students historically and currently underrepresented in the transfer process.” Transfer centers are therefore equity programs and should place focus on providing services and resources for disproportionately affected groups on their campuses.

Title 5 §51027 further states that each district governing board shall ensure that transfer center staff is assigned to coordinate the activities of the transfer center, to coordinate underrepresented student transfer efforts, to serve as liaisons to articulation, student services, and instructional programs on campus, and to work with four-year college and university personnel. Clerical support for the transfer center must also be provided. Transfer centers usually consist of a transfer center director, one or more counselors, and support staff. Transfer center directors are either full-time faculty or middle management positions. Most faculty positions are counselor positions, and they are split with coordinating and counseling responsibilities.

The primary responsibility of the transfer center director is to lead all transfer efforts and create a transfer culture, coordinate all services, establish partnerships with four-year institutions, and train faculty and staff in all transfer practices and policies. The transfer center support staff consists of paraprofessionals that provide services for students. Their roles are critical, as they are at the front line and assess students’ needs in order to refer the students to transfer center services. They also lead many of the services and projects that are coordinated by the center. The number of support staff varies by college. Most transfer centers house at least one faculty counselor that is a specialist in all transfer related

matters. These counselors will provide educational, career, and personal counseling to all students that utilize the transfer center.

The manual *California Community College Transfer Center Recommended Guidelines*, which was created in 2017 by a group of transfer center directors and the California Community Colleges Chancellor Office, offers insight into the responsibilities of the transfer center and the role of the transfer center at the college. This manual is a crucial resource for establishing or evaluating each college's transfer center. For example, the manual recommends that a transfer center have a specific location on a California community college campus that is readily accessible and identifiable to students, faculty, and staff as the focal point of transfer activities.

ASSIST, the Role of Counseling Faculty, and the Role of Discipline Faculty

From its establishment in 1985, the Articulation System Stimulating Interinstitutional Student Transfer (ASSIST) has provided the most up-to-date and accurate information regarding student transfer in California ("General Information About ASSIST," n.d.). This resource has proven pivotal not only for the transfer students looking to transfer to a four-year public university but also for faculty, both counseling and instructional.

The information contained on ASSIST allows counseling faculty to judiciously map out the courses a student would need for a seamless transfer to the UCs and CSUs. An articulation agreement by major (AAM) displays the lower-division preparation for a major at a specific public four-year institution. It also shows what courses offered at a California community college are comparable to the lower-division major preparation at four-year colleges and universities. By using this information, counseling faculty are able to show students that completion of those articulated courses at a CCC will greatly benefit the student upon transfer. ASSIST makes concrete to students that the courses they have completed will be granted credit and will count toward their unit or course requirements for the completion of the baccalaureate degree.

Additionally, within guided pathways, counseling faculty play a vital role in student success, completion, and transfer. Whereas instructional faculty are the subject-matter discipline experts, counseling faculty are the experts on certificate or degree requirements, general education requirements, and transfer requirements. The counselors interpret the information on ASSIST and a university's selection criteria to help students create comprehensive student education plans that align with the students' transfer goals.

For discipline faculty, ASSIST is a valuable repository of lower-division major preparation offered by the public four-year institutions in the state. It provides a resource in the development of new transfer programs and courses. Discipline faculty can see what lower-division courses would be of value to develop and offer at their colleges. If a new transfer program's goal is to provide a pathway for students from one community college to a CSU or UC offering a similar program, developing courses that would articulate as lower-division major preparation for that major is crucial. In the development of these courses, discipline faculty consult with their college articulation officers to ensure course equivalency is established. Doing so can ensure the seamless transfer of credit to the four-year institutions.

Often the AAMs for majors found on ASSIST list the transfer institution’s selection criteria, sometimes through links that take users outside of [ASSIST.org](https://assist.org). These selection criteria included courses that make up the curriculum students must complete to be eligible for admission into the major at the four-year institution. Typically, these courses must be articulated. If the community college does not offer an articulated course or the course is not articulated to the required course, students must complete that course at another college where the articulation is established in order to be competitive for admission. This situation can prove burdensome for students who might want to transfer to a CSU or UC but are at rural or isolated colleges. In such cases, ASSIST proves invaluable to discipline faculty, as it serves as a guide for what courses should be developed and offered at the college. If a course is already offered but is not articulated, faculty can begin the discussion as to how the non-articulated course could be revised to attain that articulation. However, revising a course to be equivalent to a selection criteria course for one CSU or UC could jeopardize articulation established with other institutions. Discipline faculty and the college articulation officer must therefore determine the ramifications of the course revision in light of existing articulation and whether a course revision is the best option.

External Exams (AP, IB, CLEP, Credit for Prior Learning)

The importance of external exams—Advanced Placement (AP), International Baccalaureate (IB), College Level Examination Program (CLEP), and Credit for Prior Learning (CPL)—may not be inherently evident; however, the CSUs and UCs have granted general education credit for satisfactory scores on the AP and IB, while CLEP is accepted by the CSUs for CSU GE Breadth certification. Awarding of credit for these exams benefits students in the completion of general education, as students can receive credit for what they have already learned by taking an external exam, allowing them to focus on the lower-division major preparation courses necessary for transfer. Counseling faculty, familiar with how GE credit is awarded, are equipped to help students identify options to avoid unnecessarily enrollment in courses for a GE area in which the students have already met the requirements.

CHALLENGES

As colleges seek to increase transfer rates, one persistent challenge is the counselor-to-student ratio. At most campuses, this ratio is unacceptably high, causing severe restrictions on the amount of time a counselor can spend with a student. On some campuses, counseling appointments are limited to fifteen minutes in order to manage the load. Historically, colleges were funded primarily on full-time equivalent students (FTES); however, since so many students are less than full time, the actual headcount of students is much higher than the FTES. Further complicating the situation, counselors are currently not included in the minimum of 50% of a district’s general fund that must be expended during each fiscal year for “salaries of classroom instructors” under Education Code §84362.⁵ Since counselors are not included as part of that 50%, hiring counselors makes complying with that law more difficult for districts. These limitations on the availability of counseling services impede the ability of colleges to properly guide and advise students regarding transfer.

⁵ The fifty percent law as written in Education Code §84362 states that salaries include benefits and the salaries of instructional aides. Counselors and librarians are not included.

Some campuses, however, have successful programs that have counselors assigned to smaller ratios of students, such as Puente and Umoja programs that support traditionally marginalized or underserved student populations. These programs typically report higher transfer rates for students in those programs compared to similar students not in such programs; however, many colleges find that the cost of such programs makes expanding them to serve larger numbers of students difficult despite their success.

Another challenge that many colleges face is building a transfer community. Having a dedicated and welcoming space where students can find information and meet with counselors dedicated to transfer and interact with other students who are seeking similar goals helps to create a transfer community within the college. However, many colleges currently do not have such a dedicated space or the transfer center may be a room or a bungalow on campus with relatively few dedicated resources.

A challenge that especially faces many smaller, more rural campuses is simply geography. With the nearest CSU or UC often more than 100 miles away, many students see their location as a barrier to transfer. According to the University of California (2016), 45% of UC transfers choose campuses within fifty miles of their homes, including 77% for UC Irvine and a low of 16% for UC Santa Barbara. These statistics suggest a significant barrier for students who live farther away. In other cases, students with the biggest financial need find that even if the nearest four-year campus is 25-50 miles away, they lack the reliable transportation necessary to attend, especially in more rural areas where public transportation is not a viable option.

Many of the most vulnerable student populations find that moving away to transfer is not a viable option for financial or other reasons. Finances are a barrier to education for many students. While current financial aid allocations do not fully cover the cost to attend community college full time, they can help to allay the costs; however, many potential students, especially first-generation college students, are unaware of the financial assistance for which they qualify. Some colleges reach out to the students and their families while the students are still in high school to help them realize that post-secondary education and transfer is a real possibility through the community college. Transfer program connections, events, and community college counseling courses offered at high schools can be ways to help students navigate the college and financial aid process, as could culturally relevant activities at college family nights targeting and supporting underserved communities. These activities are impactful but do require funding.

Another significant concern and barrier to student success and transfer, as seen also in nationwide trends, is that California community colleges have an increasing number of students who have food and housing insecurities. A 2019 study found that 70% of community college students nationwide experienced food insecurity, housing insecurity, or homelessness (American Association of Colleges and Universities, 2019). A student's ability to succeed can be significantly impaired if these basic needs are not met. Colleges should have consistent stable forms of support for these vulnerable populations to help them meet their educational and transfer goals.

Despite these challenges, community colleges must find ways to adjust their practices to meet the needs of students seeking to transfer. As colleges leverage existing resources, they must seek additional resources as a system to serve their communities of students.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR LOCAL ACADEMIC SENATES

- Embrace new transfer partnerships, including the UC Transfer Pathways, to facilitate the transfer path for students.
- Facilitate and encourage the partnership between discipline faculty, curriculum committees, and counseling faculty to create degrees that align with new transfer pathways such as the UC Transfer Pathways.
- Regularly evaluate disaggregated student outcomes and create recommendations to enhance and support student transfer.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR COLLEGES

- Make scheduling decisions that accommodate UCTPs and ADTs.
- Review curriculum to ensure necessary courses exist for UCTPs and ADTs.
- Reach out to students that are transfer ready to help them reach their goals.
- Embrace the various transfer partnerships including the Pilot UC Transfer degrees. This process will require collaboration between local curriculum committees and discipline faculty to create the degrees.
- Have counselors that specialize in transfer, including an articulation officer, and whenever possible house these experts in a dedicated space that can not only help build a transfer community but can provide space for collaborations with others within the campus community.

RECOMMENDATIONS FOR THE BOARD OF GOVERNORS

- Provide a dedicated and stable funding stream for transfer infrastructure such as transfer centers to facilitate increasing the number of students who are transfer ready in accordance with *the Vision for Success*.
- Direct the Chancellor's Office to work with UC and CSU partners to ensure that students who are transfer ready have access to a university that is accessible, especially to students who for financial or other reasons are unable to relocate hundreds of miles away.
- Advocate for a funding mechanism that incentivizes the hiring of more faculty counselors.

REFERENCES

- About Us. (n.d.). C-ID.net. Retrieved April 13, 2020, from <https://c-id.net/about-us>.
- Academic Senate for California Community Colleges. (2018). *A Re-examination of Faculty Hiring Processes and Procedures*. Retrieved April 13, 2020, from https://asccc.org/sites/default/files/Hiring_Paper.pdf.
- Academic Senate for California Community Colleges. (2018). Understanding the AB 705 FAQ. Retrieved April 26, 2020, from https://asccc.org/sites/default/files/Understanding705FAQ_Final.pdf.
- American Association of Colleges and Universities. (2019, June 12). Majority of College Students Experience Food Insecurity, Housing. Retrieved April 22, 2020, from <https://www.aacu.org/aacu-news/newsletter/majority-college-students-experience-food-insecurity-housing-insecurity-or>.
- Brown, T. N. T., Williams Institute, & Romero, A. P. (2016, July). Food Insecurity and SNAP Participation in the LGBT Community. Retrieved April 26, 2020, from <https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/Food-Insecurity-SNAP-July-2016.pdf>.
- California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office. (2018). *EEO & Diversity Best Practices Handbook*. Retrieved April 26, 2020, from <https://www.cccco.edu/-/media/CCCO-Website/About-Us/Reports/Files/2016-EEO-and-Diversity-Handbook-ADA.ashx?1a=en&hash=2AD6E1C18C3098C0D96A202DA8C04DC01EE2B1A5>.
- California Community College Chancellor's Office. (n.d.). Key Facts. Retrieved April 13, 2020, from <https://www.cccco.edu/About-Us/Key-Facts>.
- California Community Colleges Student Success Taskforce. (2018). *Advancing Student Success in California Community Colleges*. Retrieved Autumn 4, 2020, from https://healthylivesindex.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/ca_community_colleges_student_success_advancing_student_success.pdf.
- California Intersegmental Articulation Council. (2013, Spring). *California Articulation Policies and Procedures Handbook*. Retrieved April 26, 2020, from https://live-csusb.pantheonsite.io/sites/default/files/upload/file/CIAC_Handbook_Spring_2013.pdf.
- Children's Bureau, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. (2014, August 31). Sexual & Gender Minority Youth in Foster Care: Assessing. Retrieved April 26, 2020, from <https://www.acf.hhs.gov/cb/resource/pii-rise-lafys-report>.
- Community College League of California. (2000). *Fifty Percent Law--Background Paper*. Retrieved April 15, 2020, from <https://ccleague.amza.securityserve.com/sites/default/files/training-materials/PRP50law.pdf>.
- Community College League of California. (2018, January). Community College League of California | Fast Facts 2018. Retrieved April 4, 2020, from https://www.ccleague.org/sites/default/files/images/ff2018_league_0.pdf.
- Doolittle, P. E., Hicks, D., Triplett, C. F., Nichols, W. D., & Young, C. A. (2006). Reciprocal Teaching for Reading Comprehension in Higher Education: A Strategy for Fostering the Deeper Understanding of Texts. *International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education*, 17, 106–118. Retrieved from <http://www.isetl.org/ijtlhe/>.
- Durso, L. E., & Gates, G. J. (2012, July 12). Serving Our Youth: Findings from a National Survey of Services Providers Working with Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgender Youth Who Are Homeless or At Risk of Becoming Homeless. Retrieved April 26, 2020, from <https://escholarship.org/uc/item/80x75033>.
- General Information about ASSIST. (n.d.). Retrieved April 13, 2020, from <https://resource.assist.org/About/General-Information>.
- HBCU Transfer Participating HBCU – California Community College Transfer Counselor Website. (n.d.). Retrieved April 13, 2020, from <https://ccctransfer.org/hbcu/campuses/>.
- Henry, B. L., & Knight, W. E. (2003) *What matters in the university graduation of community college transfer students*. Paper presented at the annual conference for the Association for Institutional Research, Tampa, FL.
- Kilgo, C. A., Ezell Sheets, J. K., & Pascarella, E. T. (2014). The link between high-impact practices and student learning: some longitudinal evidence. *Higher Education*, 69(4), 509–525. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10734-014-9788-z>.
- Research and Planning Group. (2019, March). *Transfer Odds: Technical Report Examining Factors That Impact Whether Students Achieve Transfer or Get Stuck Near or At the Gate*. Retrieved April 13, 2020, from <https://rpggroup.org/Portals/0/Documents/Projects/ThroughtheGate/Through-the-Gate-Transfer-Odds-Technical-Report.pdf?ver=2019-04-02-083808-677>.
- Sanders, W.L., Wright, S.P. & Horn, S.P. (1997). Teacher and Classroom Context Effects on Student Achievement: Implications for Teacher Evaluation. *Journal of Personnel Evaluation in Education* 11, 57–67.
- University of California. (2016). University of California. 1: Undergraduate Admissions and Enrollment. Retrieved April 26, 2020, from <https://accountability.universityofcalifornia.edu/2016/chapters/chapter-1.html#1.1.3>.

APPENDICES

Transfer Center Directors Recommended Essential Duties

Outlined in “The California Community College Transfer Center Recommendation Guidelines”.

- Serving as the primary contact person for inquiries from community college administrators, faculty, staff, students, and the community concerning the college’s transfer programs and services.
- Serving as a liaison between the community college and baccalaureate-level universities in regard to admission policies and transfer requirements.
- Working with campus faculty and administration to ensure that the transfer function is clearly identified as a primary mission of the college. Is the transfer mission clearly articulated in the college’s mission statement and goals? Is transfer information clearly conveyed on the college website and in the college catalog, class schedule, newsletters, and brochures? Does the campus provide for adequate transfer facilities and adequately trained staff to ensure a strong and viable transfer program? Are the fiscal needs of the transfer function considered in the budget planning process? Does the college offer a curriculum that supports transfer, and are the lower-division requirements of nearby institutions considered in curriculum development?
- Working with college administrators to coordinate the activities of the Transfer Center with other instructional and student services programs on campus and to encourage cooperative working relationships.
- Informing the college’s academic senate of critical transfer initiatives and policy changes and encouraging the participation of instructional faculty in the development, implementation and evaluation of transfer efforts. Working with instructional faculty to incorporate the transfer function as a part of the syllabus of select courses offered at the community college.
- Establishing and chairing the Transfer Center Advisory Committee developed to assist in supporting and strengthening transfer activities on campus. This committee may include a governing board member, an academic senate representative, instructional and counseling faculty, students, administration, student services and representatives from local universities.
- Working with the campus articulation officer to monitor and encourage the development of articulation agreements and campus participation in articulation efforts.
- Directing the Transfer Center and its budget, and directing the activities of the Transfer Center staff.
- Providing ongoing information and training to counselors and Transfer Center staff regarding new transfer options and policies, changing requirements, university selection criteria, ASSIST, UC Pathways and university application procedures to ensure that accurate and up-to-date information is being conveyed to students.

- In conjunction with the Counseling Department, providing transfer counseling that supplements the counseling that takes place within the Counseling Department. Transfer Center counseling often includes handling complex transfer cases referred to the Transfer Center by counselors, administrators or instructional faculty; the evaluation of independent and out-of-state transcripts for transfer to UC, CSU or other baccalaureate-level colleges or universities (if applicable, consult with transcript evaluators); research regarding transfer requirements to independent or out-of-state universities; or advocacy for students to educate and empower them in the admission appeal process.
- Receiving daily California Community College and university updates through the statewide Transfer Center Director's distribution list (organized through the CCC Chancellor's Office) and redirecting these updates to counselors, Transfer Center staff, and appropriate administrators and instructional faculty.
- Developing a comprehensive Transfer Center webpage that includes information on in-state and out-of-state public and private universities, and identifying and purchasing resource books and materials that assist students with their research in transitioning from a community college to a university, such as college and university catalogs, university reference guides, scholarship reference guides, college essays and other resource books and published materials.
- Directing the college's TAA or Transfer Admission Agreement (TAG) and ADT programs with universities.
- Providing transfer courses, workshops and classroom presentations that include information about university admission requirements, selection criteria, TAAs and application processes to baccalaureate-level campuses. These classes, workshops and presentations should be provided for all students, including EOPS, DSPS, foster youth, Puente, veterans and Umoja students. Note: All of these programs include large numbers of low-income and first-generation college students.
- Encouraging and participating in campus-wide efforts to identify and remove barriers to the retention and transfer of all students, including low-income, disabled and first-generation college students and other populations identified by the college's Student Equity data and to assist with the efforts of developing strategies to improve the transfer rate for these students.
- In conjunction with regional universities and the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, develop and implement methods to evaluate the effectiveness of local transfer activities.
- Encouraging staff from university admissions offices to participate in Transfer Center activities: to meet regularly with potential transfer students to discuss academic options, evaluate transcripts and assist in planning transfer coursework; to provide transfer and application workshops for students; to attend Transfer Center Advisory Committee meetings; and to attend annual Transfer Day/College Night programs. University staff have asked that a single location be identified at each community college as their point of contact for all transfer activities.
- Directing the Transfer Center's university tour program.

- Collaborating with other California Community College campuses to obtain information and best practices to develop strong Transfer Center programs and transfer activities.
- Attending regional Transfer Center Directors meetings coordinated by the CCC Chancellor’s Office and attending the annual CCC statewide Transfer Center Directors meeting. In addition, attending transfer meetings and conferences sponsored by UC, CSU and independent colleges and universities.
- Collaborating with the Admissions Office/ Enrollment Services/Evaluations Offices to ensure the Associate Degree for Transfer is verified and posted on students’ transcripts in a timely manner.
- Writing and submitting the annual Transfer Center Report to the CCC Chancellor’s Office.
- Reporting to the college governing board annually on transfer numbers and community college or university trends or policies that are affecting transfer students.
- Serving as a member of the statewide Transfer Center Director Association (i.e., WACAC) and participating on the Transfer Advocacy Committee.

Counseling Faculty Recommended Essential Duties

Counselors working in the Transfer Center assist the Transfer Center Director with all aspects of the counseling and teaching activities of the center. Outlined in the “California Community College Transfer Center Recommendation Guideline”.

- In conjunction with the Counseling Department, providing transfer counseling that supplements the counseling that takes place within the Counseling Department. Transfer Center counseling often includes handling complex transfer cases referred to the Transfer Center by counselors, administrators or instructional faculty; the evaluation of independent and out-of- state transcripts for transfer to UC, CSU or other baccalaureate-level colleges or universities (if applicable, consult with the transcript evaluators); research regarding transfer requirements to independent or out-of-state universities; or advocacy for students to educate and empower them in the admission appeal process.
- Checking TAAs for completion and accuracy prior to sending them to the universities for approval. Assisting in reviewing the ADTs for the purposes of meeting the requirements for the degree and similar majors at the receiving institution.
- Providing transfer courses, workshops and classroom presentations that include information about university admission requirements, selection criteria, TAAs and application processes to baccalaureate-level campuses. These classes, workshops and presentations should be provided for all students and include special programs that serve low-income, disabled, first-generation college students, veterans, foster youth, and other populations identified by the college’s Student Equity data.
- Encouraging and participating in campus-wide efforts to identify and remove barriers to the retention and transfer of low-income, disabled, and first-generation college students and other

populations identified by the college's Student Equity data. Assisting in campus-wide efforts to develop strategies to improve the transfer rate for these students.

- Organizing campus tours to baccalaureate-level colleges and universities and assisting with the coordination of Transfer Day/College Night.
- Assisting in the creation and operation of technology-enhanced transfer counseling, *i.e.*, online chats with university representatives for transfer students.

Classified Staff Recommended Essential Duties

Outlined in "The California Community College Transfer Center Recommendation Guidelines".

- Working at the front line of the Transfer Center to greet students, answer student transfer questions and refer students to Transfer Center counselors or to the Counseling Department as appropriate.
- Publishing a calendar (both online and in print) of Transfer Center activities to inform students and the campus community of ongoing transfer activities taking place on campus.
- Assisting students with transfer research using both online and print resources.
- Assisting students with university applications.
- Monitoring and tracking all incoming and outgoing TAAs, which includes maintaining a database of mailed/approved/denied TAAs and notifying students and counseling faculty of TAA status.
- Developing communication tools to publicize Transfer Center activities to the campus, including posters, social media and any tools used on campus to promote activities.
- Scheduling appointments for visiting university representatives and Transfer Center counselors.
- Ordering and maintaining all transfer resource books and materials.
- Handling all clerical support for the Transfer Center Director and Transfer Center Counselors.
- Supervising student employees.
- Chaperoning with the University transfer tours.
- Assisting with maintaining and updating the Transfer Center webpage.

Educational Planning Tools

An integral part of the counseling process is the creation of a comprehensive educational plan. An educational plan will consist of courses and strategies that will assist students navigate their time at the college and complete their goal. The courses consist of general education, major and elective courses that meet transfer requirements of the university they are seeking to transfer.

The following are online educational planning systems that are the commercial products commonly used in community colleges at the time of this paper:

- Star Fish Solutions
- Degree works
- PeopleSoft

Some of these online educational planning systems provide degree audits, detailed course description, draft educational plans for students navigate, course forecast demands, and prerequisite/corequisite requirements. Other than these three tools, several colleges that have home grown online educational planning tools.

The Associate Degrees for Transfer Approved as of Fall 2019

- | | |
|------------------------------------|--|
| ▪ Administration of Justice | ▪ English |
| ▪ Agriculture Animal Science | ▪ Environmental Science |
| ▪ Agriculture Business | ▪ Film, Television, and Electronic Media |
| ▪ Agriculture Plant Sciences | ▪ Geography |
| ▪ Anthropology | ▪ Geology |
| ▪ Art history | ▪ Global Studies |
| ▪ Biology | ▪ History |
| ▪ Business Administration | ▪ Hospitality Management |
| ▪ Chemistry | ▪ Journalism |
| ▪ Child and Adolescent Development | ▪ Kinesiology |
| ▪ Communication Studies | ▪ Law, Public Policy and Society |
| ▪ Computer Sciences | ▪ Mathematics |
| ▪ Early Childhood Education | ▪ Music |
| ▪ Economics | ▪ Nutrition and Dietetics |
| ▪ Elementary Children Education | ▪ Philosophy |

- Physics
- Political Science
- Psychology
- Public Health Science
- Social Justice Studies
- Social Work and Human Services
- Sociology
- Spanish
- Studio Arts
- Theatre Arts

The Twenty Majors in the UC Transfer Pathways

- Anthropology
- Biochemistry
- Biology
- Business administration
- Cell biology
- Chemistry
- Communication
- Computer science
- Economics
- Electrical engineering
- English
- History
- Mathematics
- Mechanical engineering
- Molecular biology
- Philosophy
- Physics
- Political science
- Psychology
- Sociology

The Majors in the UC Pathways+

- Anthropology
- Biochemistry
- Biology
- Business administration
- Cell biology
- Chemistry
- Communication
- Computer science
- Economics
- Electrical engineering
- English
- History
- Mathematics
- Mechanical engineering
- Molecular biology
- Philosophy
- Physics
- Political science
- Psychology
- Sociology



 This publication is printed on recycled paper. Please recycle your copy when done.

Academic Senate for California Community Colleges
One Capitol Mall, Suite 230, Sacramento, CA 95814
916.445.4753 www.asccc.org

©2020 Academic Senate for California Community Colleges

