PROPOSAL #A:
Proposed Revision Discipline: Credit Apprenticeship Instructors – Amend Title 5 §53413(a)
Organization: Academic Senate for California Community Colleges

Current Minimum Qualifications:
Title 5 §53413:
(a) The minimum qualifications for service as a community college faculty member teaching credit apprenticeship courses shall be satisfied by meeting one of the following requirements:
(1) Possession of an associate degree, plus four years of occupational experience in the subject matter area to be taught; or
(2) Six years of occupational experience, a journeyman’s certificate in the subject matter area to be taught, and completion of at least eighteen (18) semester units of degree applicable college level course work, in addition to apprenticeship credits.
(b) The minimum qualifications for service as a community college faculty member teaching noncredit apprenticeship courses shall be either of the following:
(1) The minimum qualifications for credit apprenticeship instruction as set forth in this section, or
(2) A high school diploma; and six years of occupational experience in the occupation to be taught, including at least two years at the journeyman level; and sixty clock hours or four semester units in materials, methods, and evaluation of instruction. This last requirement may be satisfied concurrently during the first year of employment as an apprenticeship instructor.

Proposed Change:
(a) The minimum qualifications for service as a community college faculty member teaching credit apprenticeship courses shall be satisfied by meeting one of the following requirements:
(1) Possession of an associate degree, plus four years of occupational experience in the subject matter area to be taught; or
(2) Six years of occupational experience in the subject matter to be taught, a journeyman’s certificate where available in the subject matter area to be taught, and
completion of at least eighteen (18) twelve (12) semester units of degree applicable college level course work, in addition to apprenticeship credits.

(A) The 12 units may be completed within two years of the date of hire; or

(3) Six years of occupational experience in the subject matter to be taught, and served as an apprenticeship instructor for an approved apprenticeship training for a minimum of ten years; or

(4) The equivalent.

(b) The minimum qualifications for service as a community college faculty member teaching noncredit apprenticeship courses shall be either of the following:

(1) The minimum qualifications for credit apprenticeship instruction as set forth in this section, or

(2) A high school diploma; and six years of occupational experience in the occupation to be taught, including at least two years at the journeyman level; and sixty clock hours or four semester units in materials, methods, and evaluation of instruction. This last requirement may be satisfied concurrently during the first year of employment as an apprenticeship instructor.

Background and Rationale:

Following a proposal adopted in January 2017 by the California Apprenticeship Council (CAC) to revise the credit apprenticeship instructor minimum qualifications by amending Title 5 §53413, the ASCCC raised concerns with the Chancellor’s Office that the it was not being consulted and, more importantly, the CAC proposal would significantly weaken the minimum qualifications to teach credit apprenticeship classes (see Appendix A). The CAC asserted that it was the sole representative of apprenticeship faculty and labor organizations authorized by Ed Code §87357 to make recommendations to the BOG on apprenticeship MQs, citing the following language:

With regard to minimum qualifications for apprenticeship instructors, the board of governors shall consult with, and rely primarily on the advice and judgment of, appropriate apprenticeship teaching faculty and labor organization representatives.

The Chancellor’s Office agreed that while the CAC could represent the labor organizations, all faculty MQs are an academic and professional matter under the purview of the ASCCC and that the ASCCC is thus the appropriate representative of apprenticeship faculty. The Chancellor’s Office and ASCCC agreed to the following process for revising the credit apprenticeship MQs:

1. March/April 2017
   • ASCCC apprenticeship work group consisting of apprenticeship instructors and ASCCC Executive Committee members meets to develop a proposal. Review and action is then taken by the ASCCC Standards and Practices and Executive Committees.

2. May 2017
   • The ASCCC holds first hearings in the north and south on proposed MQ revision.
3. **May/June 2017**
   - Reconcile language if necessary through a “conference committee” of CAC, ASCCC (including apprenticeship faculty), and Chancellor’s Office representatives to create final draft proposal. CCCCC Legal to take compromise language and turn it into draft Title 5 language.

4. **August/September 2017**
   - Executive Committee reviews draft Title 5 language.

5. **October 2017**
   - Proposal reviewed at Area meetings.
   - California Apprenticeship Council takes action.
   - Late October - Agenda item prepared for November Consultation Council.

6. **November 2017**
   - Fall Plenary – Breakout session, second hearing, and action.
   - ASCCC proposal taken to Consultation Council if delegates approve the proposed changes.

7. **January 2018**
   - First reading by the Board of Governors.

8. **March 2018**
   - Second reading/action by the Board of Governors

The ASCCC apprenticeship work group did meet on April 6 and drafted the proposal which was endorsed by the Executive Committee on April 20. During this period, the Chancellor’s Office drafted an alternate proposal that included an emergency provision that was not endorsed by the Executive Committee (see Appendix A). The ASCCC held first hearings on May 3 at Los Angeles City College and May 4 at the San Jose Marriott. However, the planned process for the Chancellor’s Office to convene and moderate a conference committee and reconcile language never occurred. The status of the Chancellor’s Office proposal is also still in question. The status of the January 2017 CAC proposal is unknown. Nonetheless, the Executive Committee decided to honor the work of the apprenticeship work group and move forward with that proposal to the Fall 2017 Plenary Session for its second hearing and action.

**Rationale for the ASCCC apprenticeship work group proposal:**
- It provides three clear “paths” to meeting the MQ for credit apprenticeship instructors, and explicitly allows for the use of equivalency.
- Recognizes that there may be occupations where journey-level certificates are not available.
- Preserves the clarity of existing Title 5 language that the credit apprenticeship MQs apply to credit apprenticeship courses only. The CAC
Proposal language is written in such a way that could be construed to mean that an apprenticeship instructor meeting the credit apprenticeship MQs could teach regular credit courses.

- Ensures that occupational experience in the subject matter being taught is required for each of the MQ “paths.” One of the eight paths in the CAC proposal doesn’t explicitly require the occupational experience, only experience as an apprenticeship instructor for an approved apprenticeship training organization.

- For those who don’t possess an associate degree, provides a compromise between existing requirement of 18 units of college-level degree-applicable coursework and the CAC proposal of 6 units of college-level degree-applicable coursework, and allows the 12 units of coursework to be completed within two years of the date of hire as an apprenticeship instructor. This addresses CAC concerns about apprenticeship instructor shortages, and reflects the unit requirement proposed in AB 2070 (Campos, 2014) that was ultimately pulled by the author and attempted to insert apprenticeship MQs in Ed Code. Also, completion of the required units within 12 years is consistent with a similar allowance in the faculty internship MQs in section 53502.

- Provides a clear distinction between the credit apprenticeship MQs and the noncredit apprenticeship MQs. The CAC proposal would actually result in path for credit apprenticeship that is actually less than the existing noncredit MQs.

For more information, please go to [http://asccc.org/apprenticeship-minimum-qualifications](http://asccc.org/apprenticeship-minimum-qualifications)

**Testimonies:**
Testimonies can be in the form of written email, letters sent to the ASCCC Office, or oral testimonies made by individuals at the Fall 2016 Plenary Session. The following positions were provided via hearing or written email.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>College/Organization</th>
<th>Testimony</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bill Elaton-Selig</td>
<td>LATTC</td>
<td>Academic Senate</td>
<td>Support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marla Allegre</td>
<td>Allan Hancock</td>
<td>Academic Senate</td>
<td>Support</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carolyn Holcroft</td>
<td>Foothill College</td>
<td>Academic Senate</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mayra Cruz</td>
<td>DeAnza College</td>
<td>Academic Senate</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Philip Crawford</td>
<td>San Jose City College</td>
<td>Academic Senate</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Carl Cimino</td>
<td>Foothill/San Jose Pipe Trades</td>
<td>Training Center</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chap Power</td>
<td>Foothill/San Jose Electrical</td>
<td>Training Center</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Al Garcia</td>
<td>Diablo Valley/Pipe Trades 342</td>
<td>UA Local 342</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luis Reyes</td>
<td>A&amp;J Training Trust/HVAC</td>
<td>UA Local 250</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Armando Pulido</td>
<td>A&amp;J Training Trust/Pipes DC16 – So CA</td>
<td></td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bruce McLeod</td>
<td>Foothill College</td>
<td>Individual</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Frank Comeo</td>
<td>Foothill College</td>
<td>JATC Instructors</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert Moreno</td>
<td>Foothill College</td>
<td>JATC Instructors</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Institution</td>
<td>Organization</td>
<td>Position</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>----------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Chursin</td>
<td>Foothill College</td>
<td>SF JATC</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Phuong Tran</td>
<td>Foothill College</td>
<td>FHDA District</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moaty Fayek</td>
<td>Foothill College</td>
<td>FHDA District</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pat McGinn</td>
<td>Carpenters Union</td>
<td>CA Apprenticeship Council</td>
<td>Oppose</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix A – CAC and Chancellor’s Office Proposals

1. CAC Proposal to Amend Title 5 §53413 (credit apprenticeship only), January 2017:

(a) In addition to the minimum qualifications for service as an apprenticeship instructor teaching a credit apprenticeship course adopted by the board of governors pursuant to Section 87356, a person may also satisfy the minimum qualifications for service as an apprenticeship instructor teaching a credit course by satisfying one or more of the following:

(1) The person has served as an apprenticeship instructor for an approved apprenticeship training organization for a minimum of ten years.

(2) The person has six years of occupational experience in the subject matter area to be taught, and is a graduate of an apprenticeship program as defined in California Labor Code Section 3070-3098 in the subject matter area to be taught, and shall have already completed 6 semester units of degree-applicable college level course work.

(3) The person has six years of occupational experience in the subject matter area to be taught, a journeyman's certificate in the subject matter area to be taught, and has completed 60 hours of professional education in classroom techniques and instructional development from an accredited postsecondary institution.

If the person has not completed 60 hours of professional education in classroom techniques and instructional development, the person may be an apprenticeship instructor on the condition that the person complete 60 hours of professional education in classroom techniques and instructional development within two years of being hired

OR

Had an education plan with an affiliated post-secondary institution to earn an Associate’s degree

OR

Has completed an instructor training program which covers classroom techniques and instructional development with a focus on apprentice and journeyman education at a nationally recognized and approved apprenticeship training organization

OR

Is currently engaged in an instructor training program which covers
classroom techniques and instructional development with a focus on apprentice and journeyman education at a nationally recognized and approved apprenticeship training organization.

OR

Has received an appropriate credential from an approved educational program as recognized by the California Commission on Teacher Credentialing.

(b) The governing board of a community college (Local Education Agency) in consultation with an affiliated State or Nationally Approved Apprenticeship Training Program may provide policies that can authorize a person to serve as an apprenticeship instructor to teach a credit course in unusual circumstances.

Unusual circumstances include:

1) A shortage of qualified instructors that would impede providing classes to students (apprentices) in accordance with the education plan adopted by a Division of Apprenticeship Standards approved programs.

In these unusual circumstances an instructor would be required to have six years of occupational experience in the subject matter area to be taught, a journeyman’s certificate in the subject matter area to be taught. Each instructor teaching under this unusual circumstances provision would be required to have an education plan that satisfies any of the requirements subsection (a) above.

Note: The existing subdivision (b) states the noncredit apprenticeship MQs. The CAC did not propose changes to the noncredit apprenticeship and it is assumed that they are not seeking changes to the noncredit MQs. Under that assumption, the existing subdivision (b) would have to be relabeled as subdivision (c)

Concerns with the CAC proposal:

- The path in their proposed (a)(1) that allows for 10 years of experience as an apprenticeship instructor does not explicitly require occupational experience.
- The path in their proposed (a)(3) that requires for the completion 60 hours of education in classroom techniques, etc. is actually weaker than the current noncredit MQs. (The current noncredit MQs require a high school diploma and two years at the journeyworker level.) Furthermore, the exceptions allowed in the path in their proposed (a)(3) eliminate the requirement for actual completion of a degree (only an ed plan is required) or the
completion of the 60 hours of education in classroom techniques (enrollment only required), and further weaken their proposed credit apprenticeship MQ relative to the current noncredit MQ.

- The CAC proposed subdivision (b) allows a governing board to declare “unusual circumstances” in the event of a shortage of qualified apprenticeship instructors. This grants boards exceptional leeway, and the resulting MQ would be 6 years of occupational experience and a journeyman’s certificate, and the possession of an education plan for completing the educational requirements (completion not required).

**Update** – In July 2017 the CAC revised its proposal for the apprenticeship instructor minimum qualifications to replace the proposal from January 2017. Their revised proposal is the following:

**Minimum Qualifications for Apprenticeship Instructors**  
**Revised June 22 and June 29 2017 by the CAC Special Committee for Minimum Instructor Qualifications**

1. Six years of occupational experience in the craft related tasks to be taught, and service as an apprenticeship instructor for a national or state approved apprenticeship training organization for a minimum of ten years;

2. Six years of occupational experience in the craft related tasks to be taught, a journeyman’s certificate in the craft related tasks to be taught, and completion of at least twelve (12) semester units of degree-applicable college and or apprentice level course work;

   (A) An instructor may be hired prior to the completion of 12 units of certificate/degree applicable college and or apprentice level coursework, but the coursework must be completed within two years of the date of hire.

3. A high school diploma or equivalent and six years of occupational experience in the craft related task to be taught, including at least two years at the journeyman level; and sixty clock hours or four semester units in materials, methods, and evaluation of instruction. This last requirement may be satisfied concurrently during the first two years of employment as an apprenticeship instructor.

4. State or Nationally Approved Apprenticeship Training Programs in consultation with the Board of Trustees of a community college district may adopt policies to authorize a person to serve as an apprenticeship instructor to teach a credit course in an urgency condition.

   (A) Urgency condition is defined as: A shortage of qualified instructors that would prevent offering classes to students in accordance with
the approved education plan for the apprenticeship program adopted by the California Department of Industrial Relations, Division of Apprenticeship Standards.

(B) Each instructor hired under this urgency provision must meet the educational requirements of either subdivision (1), (2), or (3) above within two years.

2. Chancellor's Office Proposal to amend Title 5 §53413 (credit MQs only):

(a) The minimum qualifications for service as a community college faculty member teaching credit apprenticeship courses shall be satisfied by meeting one of the following two requirements:

(1) Possession of an associate degree, plus four years of occupational experience in the subject matter area to be taught; or

(2) Six years of occupational experience in the subject matter to be taught, a journeyman's certificate in the subject matter area to be taught, and completion of at least eighteen (18) twelve (12) semester units of degree applicable college level coursework, in addition to apprenticeship credits.

(A) An instructor may be hired prior to the completion of 12 units of degree applicable college level coursework, but the coursework must be completed within two years of the date of hire. Until the 12 units are completed, each instructor approved under the provisions of this section shall be employed as a temporary faculty member under Section 87482.5 of the Education Code, or

(3) Six years of occupational experience in the subject matter to be taught, and served as an apprenticeship instructor for a national or state approved apprenticeship training organization for a minimum of ten years;

(A) An approved apprenticeship training organization is one that is approved by the U.S. Department of Labor Employment and Training Administration, Office of Apprenticeship or the appropriate state agency overseeing apprenticeship programs in a U.S. state;

(4) Or the equivalent.

(b) The Board of Trustees of a community college district in consultation with the local academic senate, consistent with the requirements of Section 87360 of the Education Code, and the California Department of Industrial Relations, Division of Apprenticeship Standards may adopt policies to authorize a person to serve as an apprenticeship instructor to teach a credit course in an emergency condition.

(1) Emergency condition is defined as:

(A) A shortage of qualified instructors that would prevent offering classes to students in accordance with the approved education plan for the apprenticeship program adopted by the California Department of Industrial Relations, Division of Apprenticeship Standards.

(B) Each instructor hired under this emergency provision must meet the
educational requirements of either subdivision (a) (1) or (2) above within two years provided that the instructor possesses:
1. Six (6) years of occupational experience in the subject matter to be taught, a journeyman's certificate in the subject matter area to be taught; or
2. Four (4) years of occupational experience in the subject matter to be taught, and is within one (1) year of completing an associate’s degree.
3. Until the education requirements are completed, each instructor approved under the provisions of this subdivision shall be employed as a temporary faculty member under Section 87482.5 of the Education Code.

(b) (c) The minimum qualifications for service as a community college faculty member teaching noncredit apprenticeship courses shall be either of the following:
(1) The minimum qualifications for credit apprenticeship instruction as set forth in this section, or
(2) A high school diploma; and six years of occupational experience in the occupation to be taught, including at least two years at the journeyman level; and sixty clock hours or four semester units in materials, methods, and evaluation of instruction. This last requirement may be satisfied concurrently during the first year of employment as an apprenticeship instructor.

Note: The existing subdivision (b) on noncredit apprenticeship MQs would remain unchanged, except that it would be relabeled subdivision (c).

Concerns with the Chancellor’s Office alternative proposal:

While much of this proposal reflects the ASCCC proposal, and actually provides additional protections by deeming those apprenticeship instructors who haven’t completed the 12 units of college coursework temporary faculty per Ed Code §87482.5, the continued existence of an allowance of a board to declare an emergency condition is problematic because it expands the allowance for not completing the 12 units of college coursework in (a)(2) to also apply to partial completion of the associate degree required in (a)(1). This makes the MQ regulation more complicated than it needs to be. The ASCCC proposal that allows the 12 units of college coursework to be completed with two years of hire, and that explicitly allows for the use of local equivalency processes (which is already the practice), is sufficient. The ASCCC Executive Committee did not accept the Chancellor's Office proposal as it has determined that the compromise language of allowing someone with 6 years of occupational experience and a journeyman’s certificate two years to complete 12 units is a generous compromise. If an allowance for someone within one year of completing the associate degree is needed, then it would be better to amend the faculty internship MQs to allow for faculty internships for apprenticeship.