

Effective and Equitable Transfer Practices in the California Community Colleges

PLANNED ADOPTION SPRING 2020

Transfer, Articulation and Student Services Committee 2019-2020

Sam Foster, ASCCC South Representative, Chair

Anna Bruzzese, ASCCC South Representative

Jose Lara, Rio Hondo College

Lorraine Burnham-Levy, San Jose City College

Mark Osea, Bakersfield College

Miles Vega, Porterville College

Contents

Introduction	4
Legislation	5
Transfer Degrees.....	5
<i>Initial Placement in Math and English</i>	5
SB-1425 Community Colleges: Degree Audit System	6
Other Important Considerations.....	7
The Value and Benefits of Transferring from a Community College	7
<i>A Prescribed Path and Transfer Guarantee</i>	7
Students from a wide range of backgrounds are welcome and may thrive.....	8
The Community College Role in Student Persistence, Completion, and Transfer	8
Targeted Programs and High Impact Practices.....	9
High Impact Practices	10
Common Intellectual Experiences	10
Learning Communities.....	10
First-Year Seminars and Experiences	11
The Role of the Local Academic Senate.....	11
Equipping Students for Transfer Success.....	13
Community Colleges Removing Barriers and Creating Opportunities for Students	13
Open Admission Creates Additional Opportunity	14
The Role of Counseling and Advising	14
Disability Support Services.....	15
Students from Marginalized Groups.....	15
How Instructors Can Help Promote Transfer.....	17
Strengthening the Transfer Paths	19
Recruitment and Onboarding within the Guided Pathways Framework	19
Leveraging Counseling	20
Educational Planning Tools.....	20
Transfer Center	21
Transfer Center Director, Support Staff, and Counselors	22
Role of Transfer Director and Personnel	22
Transfer Partnerships.....	23
<i>CCC- 4- Year Pilot Program</i>	23

<i>HBCU</i>	24
<i>ADT- CSU</i>	24
<i>ADT- AICCU</i>	24
<i>Private Universities-</i>	25
<i>UC Transfer Pathways</i>	25
<i>Aligning ADTs with UC Transfer Pathways</i>	25
<i>University of California Transfer Admission Guarantees</i>	26
<i>MOU Enhancing Student Transfer</i>	26
<i>UC Transfer Pathway+</i>	26
<i>Pilot UC Transfer Degrees</i>	26
Articulation	27
The Role of the Articulation Officer	27
Transfer Preparation, ASSIST, the Role of the Discipline Faculty (Ensuring Course Equivalency), and the Role of the Counseling Faculty.....	28
C-ID (Course Identification Numbering System).....	29
External Exams (AP, IB, CLEP, Credit for Prior Learning).....	30
Initial Placement in Math and English	30
Challenges	31
Appendix	35
<i>Transfer Center Directors Recommended Essential Duties as Outlined in “The California Community College Transfer Center Recommendation Guidelines”</i>	35
Recommended Essential Duties for Classified Staff as Outlined in “The California Community College Transfer Center Recommendation Guidelines”	39
The Associate Degrees for Transfer Approved as of Fall 2019	40
The Twenty One Majors in the UC Transfer Pathways	41
The Majors in the UC Pathways+	42

Effective and Equitable Transfer Practices in the California Community Colleges

Introduction

The primary mission of the California Community Colleges includes three major components¹. Of those three, transfer is the goal most identified by community college students. Therefore, in order to address the needs and goals of so many of our students, community colleges throughout the state must provide resources that can guide students through the process. There are several important reasons to consider as to why transfer should command considerable attention at the community college.

Title 5 Section 51027 requires that “the governing board of each community college district shall recognize transfer as one of its primary missions, and shall place priority emphasis on the preparation and transfer of underrepresented students, including African-American, Chicano/Latino, American Indian, disabled, low-income and other students historically and currently underrepresented in the transfer process.” Embedded in this section are equity considerations. Not only are community colleges to place emphasis on underrepresented students, but since these students combined make up the largest percentage of community college students throughout the state, effectively serving the transfer needs our student population will partially fulfill the mandate of Title 5. Additional strategies and interventions will be required for some of our most underserved populations, however.

This paper will discuss some of the community college infrastructure that supports transfer as well as examine some effective and equitable practices around transfer.

This paper is partially in response to Resolution 4.01 (Spring 2018) which stated:

Whereas, California Education Code, Title 5 regulations, local policies and procedures, and restrictions placed on colleges by the California State University (CSU), the University of California (UC), independent institutions, and out-of-state institutions result in a wide variety of transfer practices and standards around the state leading to confusion among colleges as well as the exclusion and inequitable treatment of transfer-bound students across the system; and

Whereas, The Academic Senate for California Community Colleges has numerous resolutions in support of transfer opportunities for students such as Resolution 4.01 F17 “Support Students Transferring to UC, CSU, and Private and Out-of-State Institutions”;

¹ <https://datamart.cccco.edu/Students/Default.aspx>

Resolved, That the Academic Senate for California Community Colleges develop a paper identifying effective practices around transfer to assist colleges to create and apply uniform and equitable transfer policies and bring the paper to the Fall 2019 Plenary Session for adoption.

Beyond the resolution, there are other considerations that support the writing of this paper.

Legislation

There are several pieces of legislation that have had significant impact on how colleges prepare students for transfer including legislation around transfer degrees and around initial placement in math and English.

Transfer Degrees

Amid concern about the number of units students accumulate before transfer and about colleges requiring students to repeat courses previously taken at community college upon transfer to a four-year university, several pieces of legislation were passed as signed into law, the most consequential of these was Senate Bill (SB) 1440. Signed into law on September 29 2010, SB 1440, the Student Transfer Achievement Reform Act, overhauled how a student transfers from a California Community College (CCC) to a California State University (CSU). The resulting Associates Degrees for Transfer (ADTs) first issued in 2011 offered significant benefits to students, including minimizing the risk that some of the units students earned would not transfer or count toward a bachelor's degree, and insuring that it was unnecessary to repeat the courses a student successfully completed at a CCC. As a result, students are guaranteed admission into the CSU system (not necessarily the CSU campus of their choice) with an option to complete a baccalaureate degree in a similar major in no more than 60 additional units. Students know that when they transfer, they will have junior standing, and that they can progress in the attainment of a baccalaureate degree. The ADTs are intended to provide a smooth transfer pathway from the CCCs to the CSUs.

Although ADTs incentivized “students to earn an associate degree while preparing for transfer to a four-year college or university” (Padilla, SB-1440), they are meant to provide “students encouragement and support to complete their overall educational pursuits” (Padilla, SB-1440). The ADTs are meant to provide for a seamless transfer and completion of the baccalaureate degree.

Initial Placement in Math and English

Responding to growing concern that many students, and especially students of color were significantly under placed in math and English, thereby lengthening their time to graduation or transfer and in some cases becoming an insurmountable barrier to students reaching their goals, Assembly Bill 705 was signed into law in 2017. This bill resulted in Education Code 78213

which provides that colleges “shall maximize the probability that a student will enter and complete transfer-level coursework in English and mathematics within a one-year timeframe and use, in the placement of students into English and mathematics courses in order to achieve this goal, one or more of the following measures:

- High school coursework
- High school grades
- High school grade point average”

Colleges were required to be in compliance as of Fall 2019. Different criteria are used for placing students into English as a Second Language (ESL) courses

Proponents of AB 705 claimed that it would have a direct positive impact on students of color, as the placement policies and assessments instruments that have been utilized by colleges for several years have often under-placed students, especially disproportionately impacted students, far below from college level math and English, greatly impacting the amount of time students stay at the community college and the number of barriers that may arise within that time frame for the students to complete their educational goal. In contrast, those with varying levels of opposition to the legislation had concerns that pushing students to transfer-level with a compressed timeline would have negative impacts on students that may be under-prepared or choose to hone their writing or mathematics skills in preparation for college-level work. This was particularly concerning for students coming from areas that were more economically disadvantaged and for students that are unable to attend to full time due to family or job obligations. Going forward, it is important that colleges find effective ways to place and support students so that their educational goals are met without placing additional barriers to completion.

Transfer Centers across the state are vital in outcomes resulting from placement. Students will be making early decisions on college level math courses that may directly impact their transfer options and major. The importance of building strong relationships with local high schools to provide transfer and major exploration is an ideal step in the right direction. Part of the mission of Transfer Centers is to provide intensive service all year long for not only transfer ready students, but incoming transfer students.

SB-1425 Community Colleges: Degree Audit System

The California legislature declared our state is falling behind in producing the necessary postsecondary educational opportunities for individuals that will ensure the state’s prosperity into the 21 century. California is projected to need 1.3 million workers with associate degrees or certificates by 2025. A significant improvement in degree and certificate completion rates;

thus closing the gap, will improve the income of our residents and the tax base of the state. In order to improve the success rates and support student persistence the California legislature mandated a degree audit system to be in place by December, 2019. This system will be paired with the individual California Community College's Learning Management System to improve student learning outcomes.

Other Important Considerations

Students may need to take more courses because of the difference in requirements of various transfer institutions in the UC and CSU due to the nature of the programs

Regardless of how one feels about the above legislation and others affecting transfer, the mere fact that they exist is evidence of the wide-reaching concern about the time it takes for students to transfer as well as the muted transfer rates especially for students of color and other historically underserved students. Transfer is sufficiently important to the Board of Governors that the *Vision for Success* adopted in 2017 specifically calls out transfer and sets an ambitious goal to increase the number of transfers to the California State Universities (CSUs) and the University of California (UC) by 35 percent. Beyond this systemwide goal, it is incumbent upon every college to help its students meet their own transfer goals whether to a UC, CSU, or other institution.

Currently, nearly half of students earning a bachelor's degree from a University of California campus in science, technology, engineering and mathematics transferred from a California community college. Also, twenty-nine percent of University of California graduates and 51% of California State University graduates started at a community college².

The Value and Benefits of Transferring from a Community College

A Prescribed Path and Transfer Guarantee

Even before the broad-based adoption of a guided pathways framework, colleges provided specific guidance to students who sought transfer to either a CSU or a UC. Students who completed appropriate coursework and met the qualifying GPA could be guaranteed admission to many four-year institutions. While guaranteed admission is not available at every institution, this remains an attractive option for many students.

² <https://www.cccco.edu/About-Us/Key-Facts>

Students from a wide range of backgrounds are welcome and may thrive.

For students who are not traditionally considered college-ready, starting at a community college provides an opportunity to hone their skills and improve their confidence on their way to a bachelor's degree. Even for students not academically prepared for university and the freedoms that come with traditional college life, community colleges often provide more support services. With generally small class sizes, community college students are able to interact with instructors easily. This type of structure can be beneficial for traditionally underserved students and especially first-generation college students. Hence, the number of first-generation college students that graduate from UC that originated at a community college are comparable to native UC students despite the fact that many of these community college students may not have been UC eligible upon graduation from high school.³ Many first-generation students who are academically prepared for the university may benefit from the more hands on approach at the community college.

The Community College Role in Student Persistence, Completion, and Transfer

The community college has a responsibility to help students reach their goals. This is certainly true with regards to transfer. Since students enter college with a wide range of skills and needs, we must find a way to engage students who list transfer as a goal along their educational path. This requires serving the diverse needs of students through an equitable use of the limited resources available including leveraging existing resources where possible. While the students themselves must also play an important role in their ultimate success, many of the structures of the college shoulder much of the responsibility to engage and support the student. From the local academic senate to the instructors and services designed to support instruction and student success, the college must take inventory of the roles they play in helping students meet their transfer goals.

A study of students who list transfer as their primary goal was done by the RP Group. The study, entitled “Through the Gate” indicates that a significant number of students who list transfer as their goal, do not make it through the transfer gate. Including a significant number who are already at the gate (having met the requirements to transfer) or near the gate (with enough units to transfer, but missing transferable math and/or English)⁴. Further we find that

³ https://www.ccleague.org/sites/default/files/images/ff2018_league_0.pdf

⁴ <https://rpgroup.org/Portals/0/Documents/Projects/ThroughtheGate/Through-the-Gate-Transfer-Odds-Technical-Report.pdf?ver=2019-04-02-083808-677>

some students don't persist long enough to approach the transfer requirements, resulting on lower transfer rates for these groups. A variety of reasons were cited for students at the gate not transferring including lack of access to their local UC or CSU campus. While some of these may be out of the immediate control of the community college, those who are near the gate but do not transfer as well as those who list transfer as a goal but do not persist, need to be addressed by the community college.

As colleges work to improve transfer rates overall, special attention must be paid to the transfer rates of Black/African American, Latinx, Pacific Islanders, and others students that have been disproportionately impacted by the practices historically used within the community college system.

Targeted Programs and High Impact Practices

Throughout the California Community College system there are programs that have demonstrated positive impact on traditionally underrepresented or marginalized groups. One such program is the Umoja Program. Designed to assist African American and other historically underrepresented students who desire to transfer to four-year colleges and universities, students enrolled in the Umoja Program outperform similar students not enrolled in several key areas according to a 2018 study of the 2011-2014 cohorts.⁵

In each of the cohort years, student persistence rates were much higher for the Umoja group compared to the non-Umoja groups with persistence rates more than double by the fall of the third year indicating that Umoja students persisted from one semester to the next at a much higher rate⁶ (Umoja Study p.40) Similarly, the retention rates (from fall to fall) were also much better for each cohort versus non-Umoja students with the rates of program students nearly twice that of non-Umoja students by the year two. Completion rates, including associate degrees and certificates, were also enhanced for the Umoja group.

Other targeted programs such as Puente show significant improvement in transfer rates.⁷ These programs share some significant components including employing high-impact practices and providing culturally relevant experiences integrated throughout. Colleges must consider leveraging such practices to serve a larger population of disproportionately impacted students including historically underserved and marginalized populations.

⁵ A student enters a cohort in the year they first enroll and are followed throughout their enrollment in the system.

⁶ <https://umojacommunity.org/sites/default/files/Umoja%20Report%20Final.pdf>

⁷ <https://www.thepuenteproject.org/>

High Impact Practices

There are a number of high impact practices that have been to be beneficial to student from a variety of backgrounds, especially students from traditionally underserved communities⁸. Some of these practices are components of smaller targeted programs that already exist at the college but may be leveraged to serve a larger population of disadvantaged students. Specific practices are discussed below.

Common Intellectual Experiences

A common intellectual experience can be provided in several ways including a set of required common courses or a vertically organized general education program that includes advanced integrative studies and/or required participation in a learning community⁹. In programs like Puente students enroll in classes from the same Puente instructor for one year. Classes include a counseling course on personal development to enhance the students' success.¹⁰ While providing that level of contact for larger groups of underserved students may be challenging, colleges can consider creating common intellectual experiences in other ways, such as through learning communities.

Learning Communities

The key goals for learning communities are to encourage integration of learning across courses and to involve students with “big questions” that matter beyond the classroom. Students take two or more linked courses as a group and work closely with one another and with their professors. In some Umoja learning communities, for example, Umoja students take two or more linked classes, each using culturally relevant pedagogy, and remain together for a year. Alternatively, some programs use a cohort model where the learning community is created in the classroom as

⁸ C. A. Kilgo, et al., The Link Between High Impact Practices and Student Learning: A Longitudinal Study, *High Educ* (2015) 69:509–525. <http://www.uwindsor.ca/ctl/sites/uwindsor.ca.ctl/files/high-impact-practices-and-student-learning.pdf>

⁹ *High-Impact Educational Practices: What They Are, Who Has Access to Them, and Why They Matter*, by George D. Kuh (AAC&U, 2008).

¹⁰ <https://www.thepuenteproject.org/community-college-programs>

Umoja and non-Umoja students engage in active learning strategies. In either case, participation in learning communities is linked with increased student success.¹¹¹²

First-Year Seminars and Experiences

Programs such as EOPS, Umoja, and Puente, typically build in as a component first-year seminars or other programs that bring small groups of students together with faculty or staff on a regular basis. This may include culturally relevant seminars with speakers from the community, further providing context for the educational experience.

The effect of high impact practices align with the success factors framework developed by the RP group based on what students say they need to be successful. These include:

Six Success Factors Definitions¹³

- **Directed:** students have a goal and know how to achieve it
- **Focused:** students stay on track — keeping their eyes on the prize
- **Nurtured:** students feel somebody wants and helps them to succeed
- **Engaged:** students actively participate in class and extracurricular activities
- **Connected:** students feel like they are part of the college community
- **Valued:** students' skills, talents, abilities and experiences are recognized; they have opportunities to contribute on campus and feel their contributions are appreciated

The Role of the Local Academic Senate

For a college to meet the needs of our diverse students, local academic senates must play a vital role in both the development and the implementation of initiatives related to

¹¹ <https://umojacommunity.org/sites/default/files/Umoja%20Report%20Final.pdf>

¹² C. A. Kilgo, et al., The Link Between High Impact Practices and Student Learning: A Longitudinal Study, *High Educ* (2015) 69:509–525. <http://www.uwindsor.ca/ctl/sites/uwindsor.ca.ctl/files/high-impact-practices-and-student-learning.pdf>

¹³ *The Research and Planning Group for California Community Colleges (RP Group) developed the six success factors framework as part of the Student Support (Re)defined study.* <https://rpgroup.org/Our-Projects/Student-Support-Re-defined/SuccessFactorsFramework>

student persistence, completion and transfer. As Title 5 §53200 (b) specifies, academic senates' primary function is to make recommendations with respect to academic and professional matters. Section 53200 (c) further clarifies that these academic and professional matters include, but are not limited to several areas that are directly linked to students' ability to achieve their educational goals. These areas include curriculum, degree and certificate requirements, educational program development, standards or policies regarding student preparation and success, policies for faculty professional development, and processes for institutional planning and budget development.

Local policies should further elucidate which of the 10+1 matters are “rely primarily on” or “mutually agreed” on a given campus. Local academic senates and senate leaders need to be well versed in the legal requirements, local policies, as well as relevant trends and statewide initiatives, so they can effectively engage in an institutional dialog, make recommendations to the governing board, and be strong advocates for student success.

Whether their recommendations on the relevant 10+1 matters are “rely primarily upon” or “mutually agreed”, local academic senates should not be treated as a “rubber stamp” for the college plans, as well as district and statewide initiatives related to improving student persistence, completion and transfer. The academic Senate, as well as appropriate academic Senate committees, task forces, other groups and representatives should be actively involved in analyzing relevant trends, generating recommendations, creating plans and programs, and monitoring their implementation. The academic Senate also plays an important part in advocating for adequate resources such as funding for programs and activities, and appropriate amount of reassigned time for the Articulation Officer and other relevant positions.

The Academic Senate's involvement in promoting student persistence, completion and transfer begins with fostering equitable faculty hiring practices. With guidance from ASCCC including its paper *A Re-examination of Faculty Hiring Processes and Procedures*¹⁴ and the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office (CCCCO) with its *Equal Employment Opportunity and Diversity Best Practices Handbook (2016)*¹⁵, a document created by the CCCCCO's Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO) and diversity Advisory Committee to assist colleges in understanding and implementing the conditions around diversification of the workforce required to receive EEO funding, the local academic senate must be involved in making sure that equitable hiring practices encourage the hiring of more diverse faculty. The educational benefits of a diverse faculty are clear and not only for students of color, but for all students on campus. Once new faculty are hired, the Senate plays a key role in orienting and mentoring

¹⁴ https://asccc.org/sites/default/files/Hiring_Paper.pdf

¹⁵ <http://californiacommunitycolleges.cccco.edu/portals/0/reports/2016-eeo-and-diversity-handbook-AdA.pdf>

them, and providing them, as well as all faculty, with ongoing, equity infused professional development. Local academic senates can also collaborate with student senates and other organizations on campus to support programs such as Puente, Umoja, MESA and others that have demonstrated positive impact on the success of underserved students.

Equipping Students for Transfer Success

When students choose transfer as their educational goal, the college has a responsibility to provide guidance and support to help them reach that goal. This is especially important for traditionally underserved “students, including African-American, Chicano/Latino, American Indian, disabled, low-income and other students historically and currently underrepresented in the transfer process: including first generation college students. These students may be unfamiliar with their options, the transfer process and the timelines involved. Community college students have a variety of options when it comes to transferring to 4-year institutions. If the student opts to remain in California, there 23 campuses in the California State University system, 9 campuses in the University of California system and over 100 private/independent colleges and universities. As a part of orientation, students should be introduced to the college transfer center and the services and support offered. Students seeking to transfer should then utilize Transfer Center services as early as possible and be proactive in learning all the nuts and bolts of the transfer process to make an informed choice on their educational goals. The Transfer Centers in the community colleges offer a wide variety of services which include but are not limited to transfer exploration, college tours, access to 4-year institution representatives, transfer fairs, transfer conferences, meetings with transfer counselors, and computers to access information. Once a student has made their informed choice on major and 4-year institutions they should meet with a transfer counselor to create an educational plan and discuss strategies to have a successful transfer process.

Community Colleges Removing Barriers and Creating Opportunities for Students

For many potential community college students, the prospect of attending college may seem daunting. Especially for those with anxiety or other issues, being closer to home provides a more comforting path to undertake this challenge. Furthermore, since some students do not have a university near them and must move away or travel great distances to attend a CSU or

UC, this added pressure may affect students profoundly. Attending a local community college allows the student to remain in a familiar home environment while engaging in the challenges of higher education.

Open Admission Creates Additional Opportunity

For various reasons, many students completing high school do not acquire the appropriate GPA, or SAT scores to qualify to enter the school of their choice. For these students, access to higher education is made possible by the Community College System. Community Colleges have open admission policies which offer the opportunity to build skills, knowledge and comfort with the demand of higher education. This assures that high school students who do not meet the eligibility requirements for a CSU/UC have an opportunity to pursue higher education. This is particularly important for non-traditional students. Some students may need to work right after high school ends and many are compelled to work while they are in high school. This additional burden takes time away from studying and may prevent them from participating in college preparatory classes such as Advanced Placement classes, further limiting their opportunity enter a traditional four-year university.

The pathway to a 4-year degree is facilitated through many different programs that target underrepresented students at the community college system. There are many academic and student support programs available at community colleges. Some of the services are EOP&S, Trio/SSS, DSP&S, Transfer Center, CalWorks, and Dreamers Resources Centers. Some of the academic programs are Honors Program, Puente, Umoja and supplemental instruction. These are equity programs and services that support students in their path to success. Additionally, various initiatives and partnerships with four-year institutions are helping students to transition between the two-year and four-year schools. Though still not seamless, such partnerships encourage and facilitate the transfer from CCCs to CSU/UCs and other four-year institutions.

The Role of Counseling and Advising

Academic advising at four-year institutions is often done by faculty advisors. While this is a valuable tool, they do not provide the holistic approach used by most CCC counselors. Counselors incorporate career exploration strategies, academic assessment tools, and personal counseling to assist students in making informed decisions about their educational pursuits.

According to a 2012 report by the California Community Colleges Student Success Task Force titled *Advancing Student Success in California Community Colleges*, student to counselor ratios in the community colleges range from 800 to 1 to more than 1,800 to 1¹⁶. This rate far exceeds the ASCCC recommendation of a counselor/student ratio of 1:370, contained in the 2003 document titled *Consultation Council Task Force on Counseling* (ASCCC, 2003, p. 22)¹⁷.

This ongoing counseling shortage is among the catalysts for restructuring initiatives such as Guided Pathways that aim to break down silos between student services and instruction. Undoubtedly, students would benefit from stronger connections between these two crucial areas of the college. The scarcity of counselors also underscores the essential role of classroom faculty, who interact with students daily, in helping students persist, complete and transfer.

The role of highly trained counselors is a critical component helping students to realize their transfer potential and guiding them through the process, including helping students understand the wide variety of transfer pathways and agreements available as will be discussed later.

Disability Support Services

Disability Support Services provide a wide range of services for students with disabilities. One of their primary functions is to serve as an advocate for students with disabilities in an educational setting. The transfer process is challenging, especially if the disability may impact the completion of a transfer requirement. For example, a student with a learning disability may have difficulty in completing the quantitative reasoning requirement and may require support and advocacy from Disability Support Services. In order for students with disabilities to have success in the transfer process a strong relationship must be established among community colleges' DSS and DSS at 4-year institutions especially in the cases as stated above.

Students from Marginalized Groups

Because of the relative ease of access, students from marginalized groups attend community colleges in higher numbers as well as higher percentages than are found in the UC or CSU system. This includes first generation college students as well as students of color. Colleges

¹⁶ https://healthyplacesindex.org/wp-content/uploads/2018/02/ca_community_colleges_student_success_advancing_student_success.pdf

¹⁷ https://www.asccc.org/sites/default/files/publications/Standards-of-Practice_0.pdf

must take into account the specific needs of these students. Students of color benefit from targeted programs such as Umoja, Puente, EOPS and others. Part of the success in these programs resides in the fact that they provide culturally relevant pedagogy, support and mentoring. Students frequently find that faculty and others in the program make special efforts to understand their needs, provide a sense of community and often have shared background and experiences. Of our 114 community colleges, currently Umoja programs exist at 71 colleges and Puente in 66 of them. Given the success of these programs, colleges without them would do well to consider adding similar programs or consider other ways to provide high impact practices that include a mentoring component, especially for students of color.

In supporting marginalized students, colleges must be mindful of the intersectionality of students in that they may be a part of multiple marginalized communities. To that end, it is imperative that colleges support the LGBTQ+ communities on their campuses. For example, seventy percent of LGBTQ+ students in the California community college system identify as people of color.¹⁸ In addition, LGBTQ+ people are overrepresented among foster youth with the majority of those being people of color¹⁹, forty percent of homeless youth are LGBT²⁰, and this population is more likely to be low income with nearly 27% of LGB adults 18-44 on SNAP compared to 20% of non LGB adults in the same age range.²¹ One campus reported that 19% of students visiting their food pantry identified as LGBTQ+. This illustrates that supporting LGBTQ+ students also supports other marginalized groups.

Finances are often a barrier to education for many students. While current financial aid allocations do not fully cover the cost to attend the community college full time, many potential students, especially first-generation college students, are unaware of the financial assistance for which they qualify. Community college students can take advantage of many programs that offer a reduction of fees or free tuition such as a Board of Governors fee waiver, now known as College Promise, and additional funds such as a Pell Grant. Colleges need to reach out to the students and their families while they are still in high school to help them realize that post-secondary education is a real possibility, especially at the community college. One program employed by some colleges is to provide counseling classes at the local high schools. Such classes can help students navigate the college and financial aid application processes. Engaging the family is also extremely important. One strategy used to address this is for the college to have a “family night” where they reach out to families of high school students while specifically

¹⁸ Gobuyan, A. C. (2018). LGBTQ+ Students at California Community Colleges

¹⁹ https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/LAFYS_report_final-aug-2014.pdf

²⁰ <http://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/wp-content/uploads/Durso-Gates-LGBT-Homeless-Youth-Survey-July-2012.pdf>

²¹ <https://williamsinstitute.law.ucla.edu/research/lgbt-food-insecurity-2016/>

targeting underserved communities. To maximize the impact of a family night, colleges should include culturally relevant activities.

The amount of money one can save by attending a CCC for two years and then transferring is fairly substantial. But even with financial aid, making ends meet can be challenging for some students. Again, community colleges can help accommodate students with greater financial needs as class schedules tend to be more flexible with a greater number of evening and online classes, taking into consideration that students often have to work to make ends meet.

As seen also in nationwide trends, California community colleges have an increasing number of students who have food and housing insecurity. A 2019 study found that seventy percent of community college students nationwide experienced food insecurity, housing insecurity or homelessness.²² Students ability to succeed can be significantly impaired if these basic needs are not met. Colleges must have consistent stable forms of support for these vulnerable students to help them meet their educational goals which would ultimately mitigate the concerns these students have.

How Instructors Can Help Promote Transfer

At many colleges, the high student to counselor ratio mentioned above underscores the essential role of discipline faculty, who interact with students daily, in helping students persist, complete and transfer.

In response to changing student needs, faculty should continuously reflect on the curriculum and its delivery and implement changes that optimize student success. Effective institutional processes related to student learning outcomes and program review, as well as periodic curriculum updates and constructive faculty evaluations are some of the avenues for systematically promoting both individual and collective reflection. In addition to staying current in their disciplines and being aware of changes to the larger educational environment, instructors should take advantage of culturally responsive training and other similar equity infused professional development programs to stay current on the most effective teaching and mentoring practices. The importance of creating an encouraging environment based on high academic expectations and authentic care for students' well-being cannot be understated in terms of its impact on students' ability to succeed.

²² <https://www.aacu.org/aacu-news/newsletter/majority-college-students-experience-food-insecurity-housing-insecurity-or>

One of the best ways an instructor can promote transfer is to directly encourage students in their classes. It is not uncommon for students to doubt their ability to transfer to a college or university, and the positive support of an instructor can help them reframe their self-concept.

There is a strong correlation between self-esteem and self-efficacy. Genuinely expressing one's belief in a student's ability to succeed may significantly impact their future. Our students often come from homes where support is minimal or non-existent. Others face an environment that is neutral (non-encouraging) and sadly, some students are belittled or face hostility about their decision to attend college. Instructors are on the front line and can create real change in a student's psyche.

Transferring to a four-year school may be difficult or seem impossible or insurmountable to community college students. Professors can encourage transfer students by sharing their personal stories. Hearing about the struggles their instructors faced in college and seeing a positive outcome may help to instill confidence and decrease anxiety for some students.

Sharing personal stories not only provides emotional support, but they also help students understand the intricacies of the college process. First generation students and others unfamiliar with transfer can glean insights that may help them navigate the transition from a two-year college to a four-year school more efficiently.

A large number of community college faculty are products of community colleges themselves. These instructors understand the process and can pass this information along to their students. Many faculty members have personal contacts or specific knowledge about a CSU/UC that may benefit the student. Having has a personal contact to reach out to when a student has transferred to an institution that is far away from home, or an unfamiliar place can be quite helpful.

Whether designated as a faculty advisor or not, faculty can assume that role as it relates to transfer and career exploration. Using office hours to meet with students about the transfer process can benefit students greatly. Sharing specific information about the discipline, discussing expectations, industry standards and other aspects of the field can help students transition.

Another effective way to promote transfer is to announce or share transfer activities in class. Students may not see bulletin boards or social media posts, but classroom faculty have consistent contact with student and have the ability to share information about transfer. Along with the announcements, faculty can also encourage students to meet with representatives from the four-year schools and hopefully develop a relationship with them.

Counselors and advisors share transfer tools with their students – ASSIST, C-ID, etc. As contact between classroom faculty and students is more frequent, providing more time for information

to be shared, it is imperative that faculty use this opportunity to increase transfer awareness. Whether an instructor links transfer sites to their webpage or mentions it in class, it is helpful to have the information widely available.

It's imperative that faculty members engaged students in understanding the importance of networking and relationship building as they complete their degree. Faculty members should let students know that references and letters of recommendation are vital when applying to scholarships, four-year universities admission and research opportunities. Here are some tips that faculty members may share with students:

- Attain good grades and go to instructor's office hours
- When asking for a letter or reference, students should share a resume
- Make sure to ask multiple instructors for a letter of recommendation
- Share personal statement that was submitted to the college or scholarship
- Inform the instructor of any deadlines for sending letters and provide ample lead time to assure the deadline can be met

Faculty members maybe the only social capital that students may have during the course of their educational journey. Writing a letter of recommendation or serving as reference will make a difference in the students journey to accomplish their goals.

Strengthening the Transfer Paths

Recruitment and Onboarding within the Guided Pathways Framework

The guided pathways framework requires managing and sustaining a large-scale transformational change that begins in the recruitment and onboarding stage. This framework supports the goals of college completion, transfer, and the attainment of jobs with value in the labor market. A full and planned implementation of a guided pathways framework provides the ability to achieve equity for these outcomes.

In order to strengthen the transfer paths within the guided pathways framework, the recruitment stage, requires faculty and staff engagement to clarify the paths for future students. Mapping out of all programs to transfer and possible career pathways needs to include detailed information on target and career outcomes, course sequences, critical courses, embedded credentials, and progress milestones with math and other course work aligned to each program of study, and finally a commitment to K-12 partnerships which are focused on career/college program exploration.

The onboarding stage requires faculty and staff engagement to help students get on the path to their identified goal. Support to make sure students get the best start includes the use of multiple measures to assess students' needs, first-year experiences to help students explore the field of a chosen major, full program plans based on required career/transfer exploration, contextualized, and finally integrated academic support to help students pass program gateway courses. Key elements of a guided pathways framework are contained in a structured onboarding process including improved self-placement, assessment, and co-requisite instruction that provides students with clear, actionable, and usable information they need to get off to the right start in college.

In the onboarding stage guidance to help new students to choose a program of study and to develop a plan for completing is paramount. Research shows that many students arrive at college without clear goals and may not have a clear idea of the opportunities that are available to them through advising and career services. Studies suggest that those who need these resources the most are also the least likely to take advantage of them or seek them out.

During the onboarding stage in order to support their goals of transferring, student's need a clear idea early on in their community college studies of which four-year institution they intend to transfer to and which program they plan to transfer into. Addressing this need will help eliminate the setback of taking additional courses to satisfy bachelor's program requirements. Often the information on transfer requirements is complicated, hard to find, and unreliable.

Leveraging Counseling

Counseling is a key component in preparing students for transfer. With the large number of students that counselors must advise effective counseling requires the use of tools that can allow for more individual interaction with each student. Some examples of such tools commonly used throughout the state are detailed below:

Educational Planning Tools

An integral part of the counseling process is the creation of a comprehensive educational plan. An educational plan will consist of courses and strategies that will assist students navigate their time at the college and complete their goal. The courses consist of general education, major and elective courses that meet transfer requirements of the university they are seeking to transfer.

The following are online educational planning systems that are the commercial products commonly used in community colleges at the time of this paper:

- Star Fish Solutions
- Degree works
- PeopleSoft

Some of these online educational planning systems provide degree audits, detailed course description, draft educational plans for students navigate, course forecast demands, and prerequisite/corequisite requirements. Other than these three tools, several colleges that have home grown online educational planning tools.

Transfer Center

Title 5 directs each California Community College governing board to recognize transfer as an important component of its college mission and to prioritize the preparation and transfer of underrepresented students Title 5 Section 51027 establishes the requirement of a transfer plan that shall include, but not be limited to: services to be provided to students; facilities; staffing; advisory committee; and evaluation and reporting. To help colleges accomplish this goal, the transfer center has become an integral student support program for students seeking to transfer to a 4-year institution. transfer centers provide a variety of services and assist the college in creating a transfer culture. The following are some of the intensive services that are provided:

- Counseling Services
- Transfer related workshops
- Transfer fairs
- Transfer conferences
- Access to university representatives
- University tours
- University application assistance

Transfer Centers lead all components of the transfer process and are responsible for establishing relationships with other student support programs, academic affairs, community partners, and 4-year or transfer institutions to educate the college community on the transfer process.

This Title 5 section further states that Transfer Centers “shall place priority emphasis on the preparation and transfer of underrepresented students, including African-American, Chicano/Latino, American Indian, disabled, low-income and other students historically and currently underrepresented in the transfer process”. The Transfer Center is an equity program and should place focus on providing services and resources for disproportionately affected groups on their campuses.

Transfer Center Director, Support Staff, and Counselors

Title 5 section 51027 states that each district governing board shall ensure that staff is assigned to coordinate the activities of the transfer center; to coordinate underrepresented student transfer efforts; to serve as liaison to articulation, to student services, and to instructional programs on campus; and to work with four-year college and university personnel. Clerical support for the transfer center shall also be provided. The Transfer Centers usually consist of a Transfer Center Director, counselor, and a support staff. Transfer Center Directors are either full-time faculty or middle management positions. Most faculty positions are counselor positions and they are split with coordinating and counseling responsibilities.

The primary responsibility of the Transfer Center Director is to lead all transfer efforts and create a transfer culture, coordinate all services, establish partnerships with 4-year institutions, train faculty and staff in all transfer practices and policies. The Transfer Center support staff consists of paraprofessionals that provide support services for students. Their roles are critical as they are at the front-line and assess students' needs to refer them to Transfer Center services. They also lead a lot of the services and projects that are coordinated by the center. The number of support staff vary by colleges. Most Transfer Centers house a faculty counselor that is a specialist in all transfer related matters. They will provide educational, career and personal counseling to all students that utilize the Transfer Center.

The manual "California Community College Transfer Center Recommended Guidelines" that was created in 2017 by a group of Transfer Center Directors and the California Community College Chancellor Office offers insight into the responsibilities of each of the above roles and the role of the Transfer Center at the college. This manual is a crucial resource in the establishment or the evaluation of each college's Transfer Centers. For example, the California Community College Transfer Center Recommended Guidelines" recommends that a Transfer Center has a specific location on a California Community College campus that is readily accessible and identifiable to students, faculty and staff as the focal point of transfer activities.

Role of Transfer Director and Personnel

Transfer Center Directors: The primary responsibility of the Transfer Center Director leads all transfer efforts and creates a transfer culture, coordinate all services, establish partnerships with 4-year institutions, train faculty and staff in all transfer practices and policies. *The California Community College Transfer Center Recommendation Guidelines* suggests essential duties for the transfer center director (see appendix).

Classified Personnel: The primary responsibility is to work at the front line to make the first initial contact with students, answer questions, assess students' needs and make referrals to all transfer center services. *The California Community College Transfer Center Recommendation Guidelines* has recommendations for the essential duties (see appendix)

Transfer Partnerships

CCC- 4- Year Pilot Program

The signing of SB 850 (Block, 2014) established a baccalaureate degree pilot program for the California community colleges. As of Spring 2020, 15 colleges offer unique bachelor's degree programs in technical education fields. These programs offer a new intrasegmental transfer pathway, as students can transfer from any community college with an associate's degree or certificate program that fulfills the lower division major requirements in one of those fields into a bachelor's degree program at the community colleges that offer that program.

The following programs are approved:

- Airframe Manufacturing Technology, Antelope Valley College
- Industrial Automation, Bakersfield College
- Emergency Services and Allied Health Systems, Crafton Hills College
- Mortuary Science, Cypress College
- Equine Industry, Feather River College
- Dental Hygiene, Foothill College and West Los Angeles College
- Bio-manufacturing, Mira Costa College
- Respiratory Care, Modesto Junior College and Skyline College
- Automotive Technology, Rio Hondo College
- Health Information Management, San Diego Mesa College
- Occupational Studies, Santa Ana College
- Interaction Design, Santa Monica College
- Health Information Management, Shasta College

There is currently discussion among a variety of stakeholders and legislators about expanding the number of bachelor's degrees offered at community colleges as a way to meet workforce demand and to provide increased earning opportunities for workers. For example, nurses, fire fighters, and law enforcement officers who obtain a bachelor's degree after their associate's degree may receive better pay and open up advancement opportunities.

HBCU

The California Community Colleges Board of Governors has established a Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) with Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUs) to guarantee admission to students that complete an Associate Degree for Transfer (ADT). The objective of this agreement is to facilitate a smooth transition for students from all of the California Community Colleges to partnered HBCUs. To date, more than 35 HBCUs have signed on²³. These agreements simplify the transfer process and reduce students' need to take unnecessary courses, thereby shortening the time to degree completion with a cost savings

ADT- CSU

With the adoption of SB 1440 (Padilla) in 2010, a type of degree was created in the California community colleges. The Associate Degree for Transfer (ADT) is a transfer pathway articulated between California Community Colleges (CCC) and the California State University (CSU). A college student, graduating with an Associate in Arts for Transfer (AA-T) or an Associates in Science for Transfer (AS-T) in one of the 36 ADT majors, is guaranteed admission into the CSU system in a similar major, at junior standing, to finish their baccalaureate degree in no more than 60 units. In addition to guaranteed admission, students that are admitted to a CSU campus using an ADT cannot be required to repeat any required coursework completed at a community college after transfer.

ADT- AICCU

The ADT Commitment is the Association of Independent California Colleges and Universities (AICCU) sector's adaptation of the ADT pathway. While similar to the CSU ADT, there are also some differences due to the independent nature of the state's nonprofit institutions. For example, unlike CSU, AICCU institutions are not part of a system and each campus has its own admission and graduation requirements. Therefore, if an ADT transfer student meets all the requirements of admission to a participating institution, admission is guaranteed only to that *college* as opposed to a system.

The ADT Commitment:

²³ <https://ccctransfer.org/hbcu/campuses/>

- Guarantees admission for the ADT students meeting admission requirements;
- Guarantees a minimum of 60 semester/90 quarter units will transfer;
- Guarantees the student starts with junior standing.

Private Universities-

Some private universities offer community college students transfer-friendly bachelor's programs for a low price per year once they transfer. These programs are often designated as California Community Colleges-Associate Degree for Transfer (CCC-ADT) programs, which guarantees the Associate in Arts for Transfer and Associate in Science for Transfer degrees are fully transferable and are aligned to similar bachelor's degrees which can generally be completed in 90 quarter units (60 semester units) or less. This is for CCC transfer students who have recently earned their Associate Degree for Transfer (ADT), Associate of Arts (AA), or Associate of Science (AS) degree. Additional coursework beyond the 90 quarter units may be required for AA and AS transferred degrees depending on the school and completed coursework. These types of programs and partnerships specifically benefit community college students who are in the military or working because many of the courses are online and therefore accessible from anywhere. This often makes the cost of completing a bachelor's degree completion possibly lower than finishing a degree at a CSU or UC. Some of these private universities even offer programs that are fully on-line, geared for non-traditional learning and completion of degrees.

UC Transfer Pathways

This UC Transfer Pathways (UCTP) Program was developed to communicate the major preparation requirements to perspective transfer students. Each of the campuses in the UC system had to agree on the courses outlined in each transfer pathway, simplifying the process for students and allowing them to be prepared for transfer to multiple UC campuses. The pathways have been established in the 21 most sought out majors and are designed to provide clear, consistent course-taking advice for students and to satisfy UC campus admission requirements across the entire system for a specific major. It is important to note that although the UCTP addresses academic preparation, it does not provide any admission guarantees.

Aligning ADTs with UC Transfer Pathways

Since many students may not know initially if they want to transfer to a California State University (CSU) or a University of California (UC) campus, it would be helpful for students if the differences between those pathways were minimized. To facilitate this process, a transfer memo between the UC President and CCC Chancellor was agreed to and called on the UC Academic Senate to work with ASCCC to identify alignment between the UCTPs and existing

Transfer Model Curriculum (TMCs), the basis of ADTs, In some cases the current TMC requirements are consistent with the UCTP. In these majors, it may simply be a matter of having the UC campuses accept the ADTs appropriate preparation. Once these majors are identified, students can be prepared for transfer to either system by completing an ADT. Furthermore, if a guarantee can be established for students completing a UCTP, that guarantee could be extended to students earning an ADT although the GPA requirement would likely be higher for UC admission.

University of California Transfer Admission Guarantees

Transfer admission guarantees (TAGs) are currently available in some majors at six UC campuses (Irvine, Riverside, Merced, Santa Cruz, Davis, and Santa Barbara). The TAG outlines specific course and GPA requirements that the student must complete in order to receive guaranteed admission. A student is only permitted to apply for one TAG, must meet the application deadline (currently September 30), and must also apply for UC transfer admission by that deadline (currently November 30).

Since the TAGs vary by major and by UC campus, the TAG requirements typically **do not** align with the UCTP. This may create some additional challenges for students.

MOU Enhancing Student Transfer

Signed in April of 2018, this Memorandum of Understanding (MOU) outlines a series of activities in an effort to increase the number of qualified students transferring from CCC to the UC system. The goal of this agreement is to grant access and timely completion to CCC students. Recently, the UC has established a Transfer Pathway+ program that guarantees admission to students. The establishment of a guaranteed admission program was one of the activities outlined in the MOU.

UC Transfer Pathway+

The UC Transfer Pathway+ combines the pathway program and TAG to guarantee admission to the UC system for specified majors (see appendix). In this program, students are encouraged to complete the major preparation courses outlined in the UCTP and to apply for a Transfer Admission Guarantee (TAG) to one of the six campuses where they are available. A TAG is not available in all of these majors at every one of the UC campuses offering TAGs.

Pilot UC Transfer Degrees

There has been a concerted effort to increase transfer options for students by expanding transfer guarantees, especially in areas where an ADT that can fully prepare students has been difficult for colleges to create because of unit limitations and general education requirements. One such effort, the result of an agreement between the University of California Office of the

President and the California Community Colleges Chancellor's Office, is the pilot UC transfer degrees.

As a Fall 2019, the pilot is active in Chemistry and Physics. While the ADT is the result of legislation, these pilot degrees have been developed through a collaboration between the two systems, allowing the degrees to align with the typical course-taking pattern that would be completed by UC students during their first two years of study. For example, the Physics ADT has significant differences with the UCTP, but physics faculty from all three segments agree that the UCTP is better preparation for junior level coursework, but the ADT is not able to include all of the major preparation courses because of the 60 unit limit.

The pilot degrees will require colleges to create an associates degree that aligns to the UCTP. The Chancellor's Office has published templates (similar to TMCs) for colleges to use. Students pursuing one of these degrees will be required to complete the UCTP requirements plus a modified general education pattern (IGETC – 4 courses). Students will also be required to meet a higher GPA requirement than most of the available TAGs with the UC campuses.

Articulation

The Role of the Articulation Officer

The role of the Articulation Officer (AO) in the implementation of transfer coursework cannot be overemphasized. It is the AOs who develop, maintain and provide oversight of their college's transferable courses (CSU transferable courses and UC transferable courses), general education (CSU GE Breadth and IGETC), and Course Identification Number (C-ID) aligned courses. When faculty develop or revise their transferable curricula, it is the AOs who ensure that the faculty develop or revise courses that align with the California State University (CSU) and University of California (UC) regulations and standards.

In the development of the ADTs, the AOs are vital consultants to the faculty. From Articulation Agreements by Major (AAM) to Baccalaureate Course List (BCT), to General Education Certified Courses (GECCs), it is the AOs who can best guide the faculty as to how their courses can be included in their ADTs.

The AO is crucial in the maintenance of any college's articulation agreements with the CSUs, UCs, Historically Black Colleges and Universities (HBCUs), Association of Independent California

Colleges and Universities (AICCU), private four-year universities, and out-of-state universities. It is the AOs who liaise with the potential partner institution in the establishment of transfer agreements and memorandums of understanding (MOUs). Upon initial contact, the AOs facilitate the conversations between department chairs, deans, and vice presidents in the negotiation or the finalization of a final transfer MOU.

Without the important role of the AO, it would be difficult for colleges to develop their transfer and articulation programs.

Transfer Preparation, ASSIST, the Role of the Discipline Faculty (Ensuring Course Equivalency), and the Role of the Counseling Faculty

From its establishment in 1985, the Articulation System Stimulating Interinstitutional Student Transfer (ASSIST) provided the most up-to-date and accurate information regarding student transfer in California.²⁴ This proved pivotal not only for the transfer students looking to transfer to a four-year public university, but also for the faculty, Counseling and Instructional.

For the Counseling faculty, the information contained on ASSIST allowed them to judiciously map out the courses a student would need to allow for a seamless transfer to the UCs and/or CSUs. The Articulation Agreement by Major (AAM) displays the lower-division courses for a major at the public four-years (the lower-division major preparation). It also shows what courses offered at a California Community College (CCC) are comparable to the lower-division major preparation at four-years colleges and universities. By making this visible, the counseling faculty are able to show students that completion of those articulated courses at a CCC will greatly benefit the student upon transfer. It makes concrete to students that the courses they have completed will be granted credit and will count towards their unit and/or course requirements towards the completion of the baccalaureate degree.

Additionally, within guided pathways, the counseling faculty play a vital role in student success, completion, and transfer. Whereas the instructional faculty are the subject-matter discipline experts, the counseling faculty are the experts of certificate or degree requirements, general education requirements, and transfer requirements. It is the counselors who interpret the information on ASSIST and a university's selection criteria to create for a student a Comprehensive Student Education Plan (CSEP) that aligns with a student's transfer goals.

For the discipline faculty, ASSIST is a valuable repository of lower-division major preparation offered by the public four-year universities in the State. It provides a resource in the development of new transferable programs (non-ADT) and courses. Discipline faculty can see what lower-division courses would be of value to develop and offer at their CCC. If a new transferable program's goal is to provide a pathway for students from one CCC to a CSU and/or

²⁴ <https://resource.assist.org/About>

UC offering a similar program, developing courses that would articulate as lower-division major preparation for that major is crucial. It is important that in the development of these courses that the CCC discipline faculty consult with the AO to ensure course equivalency is established. This will ensure the seamless transfer of credit to the four-year institutions.

Often the AAMs for some of the majors found on ASSIST lists the transfer selection criteria (Occasionally, there are links that takes visitors to the selection criteria outside of ASSIST.org.). These courses are the courses that students must complete to be eligible for admission into the major at the four-year institution. Typically these courses must be articulated. If the CCC does not offer an articulated course or their course is not articulated to a selection course, students must complete that course at another CCC where the articulation is established to be competitive for the admission. This could prove burdensome for those students at rural and/or isolated CCCs who might want to transfer to that CSU or UC. To that end, ASSIST proves invaluable to the discipline faculty as it serves as a guide for what courses should be developed and offered at that the college. If a course is already offered but it is not articulated, it could begin the discussion as to how could the non-articulated course be revised to attain that articulation. It should be noted, however, that revising a course to be equivalent to that of a selection criteria course for one CSU or UC could jeopardize any other articulations established with other institutions. This discussion should be between the AO and the discipline faculty to determine the ramifications of the course revision with existing articulation, and whether a course revision is the best option.

C-ID (Course Identification Numbering System)

The existence of a statewide common course numbering system is not uncommon outside of California. By the early 1990s, Texas had established the Texas Common Course Numbering System. Even earlier, in the 1970s, Florida established the Statewide Course Numbering System, a stable system that is still in use to this day. In California, the establishment of a common course numbering system was elusive. From the California Articulation Number (CAN) founded in 1985, to the CSU Lower-Division Transfer Project and its Transfer CSU (TCSU) numbers²⁵ the idea of a stable course numbering system was almost elusory until the development of C-ID.

C-ID “is a faculty-driven system that was initially developed to assign identifying designations (C-ID numbers) to significant transfer courses²⁶.” C-ID descriptors undergo rigorous, intersegmental discipline review. Courses would then be submitted for review to see if it meets the minimum established by the descriptor. C-ID approval meant that courses were comparable to the descriptor. If two courses from different institutions are approved to the same C-ID descriptor, it was understood that those courses were comparable to each other.

²⁵ [CIAC Handbook Spring 2013 edition](#)

²⁶ <https://c-id.net/about-us>

Essentially, “C-ID [addressed] the need for a ‘common course numbers’ by providing a mechanism to identify comparable courses ²⁷.”

The benefit C-ID had for the articulation of courses with the CCCs, CSUs, and some of the UCs, cannot be overstated. When a course is approved for a C-ID designator, that course “is comparable to a specific course ‘descriptor’ that was developed by intersegmental discipline faculty and reviewed statewide²⁸”. This is significant in that intersegmental and intrasegmental articulations between subscribing institutions can be established. For students taking courses at multiple community colleges, having C-ID approval for their courses will mean that the receiving CCC will accept the credits they have already earned, no matter which CCC they attend. As the CSUs continue the practice of establishing articulation with CCC courses on the basis of a C-ID approval, students will know that their C-ID approved course will earn them credit upon transfer. The conceptual framework from which C-ID was established will dispel the oft-heard protestations from students and alumni alike say that their credits did not transfer, or that they had to repeat some courses because the receiving institution did not accept them.

External Exams (AP, IB, CLEP, Credit for Prior Learning)

The importance of external exams (Advanced Placement (AP), International Baccalaureate (IB), College Level Examination Program (CLEP), Credit for Prior Learning (CPL)) may not be inherently evident, however the CSUs and UCs have granted GE credit for satisfactory scores on the AP and IB, while CLEP is accepted by the CSUs for CSU GE Breadth certification. The awarding of credit for these exams benefits the student in the completion of General Education. What the student has already completed and received credit for as a result of an external exam, the student can focus on the lower-division major preparation courses necessary for transfer.

It is important that counseling faculty familiarize themselves with how GE credit is awarded to help students avoid unnecessarily completing courses for a GE area that they already met.

Initial Placement in Math and English

As mentioned earlier, initial placement in mathematics or quantitative reasoning and English or English as a Second Language has been a concern of the legislature and the governor leading to the passing of AB 705 (Irwin) in July of 2017. The intent of the bill is clear: It is to promote student transfer in two years by facilitating a student’s entry into transfer-level math and English. However, some in the process of implementing this state law, suggest that remedial coursework might be moot. As a result, many community colleges have limited the amount of

²⁷ <https://c-id.net/about-us>

²⁸ [p. 15, CIAC Handbook Spring 2013 edition](#)

pretransfer level coursework they offer, or at the very extreme, halted the offering of courses such as, intermediate algebra, elementary algebra, or courses that prepare students for freshman composition classes, among others. While that is not a requirement of the legislation, now in Ed Code section 78213, some have interpreted it that way.

For articulation, this poses challenges for UC Transferability, C-ID approval, and/or CSU GE Breadth and IGETC approvals as some approvals rely on a course having stated prerequisites of the remedial classes. For example, for a CCC course to receive C-ID approval for microeconomics²⁹ a CCC course must have, at minimum, elementary algebra as a stated prerequisite. If a CCC deleted the elementary algebra from their microeconomics course, upon re-submission for C-ID approval, that CCC's Microeconomics course could be denied the C-ID.

The implications for curriculum development is such that CCCs should not remove any remedial coursework prerequisites from their transfer-level courses. Changing prerequisites require re-submission for any approved C-ID, UC transferability, CSU GE and/or IGETC attributes. If those prerequisites are removed, there is no guarantee that the approved attributes will be re-certified upon re-review.

The Academic Senate for California Community Colleges (ASCCC) advocates for CCCs to not delete any remedial courses that are prerequisites for their transfer-level courses from the Course Outline of Records (CORs), regardless whether the classes will be offered or not³⁰. This will ensure the continued transfer approvals for those courses, especially during the initial stages of AB 705 implementation.

Challenges

As colleges seek to increase transfer rates, one of the challenges continues to be adequate funding. This manifests itself in many ways. One persistent challenge is the counselor to student ratio. At most campuses this is unacceptably high causing severe restrictions on the amount of time a counselor can spend with a student. On some campuses, counseling appointments are limited to 15 minutes in order to manage the load. There are several reasons for this. Historically, colleges were funded primarily on full-time equivalent students (FTES), however, counselors don't see any full-time equivalent students, they see actual students. And since so many of our students are less than full time, the actual head-count of students is much higher than the FTES. Further complicating the situation, counselors are currently on the

²⁹ [C-ID ECON 201](#)

³⁰ [AB 705 FAQs](#)

“wrong side” of the 50% Law³¹, so that hiring counselors moves a college away from compliance with that law.

Another challenge that many colleges face is building a transfer community. Having a dedicated and welcoming space where students can find information and meet with counselors dedicated to transfer and interact with other students who are seeking similar goals, helps to create a transfer community within the college. However, many colleges currently do not have such a dedicated space and the transfer center may be a room or a bungalow on campus with relatively few dedicated resources.

A challenge that especially faces many of our smaller more rural campuses is simply geography. With the nearest CSU or UC often more than 100 miles away, many students see this as a barrier to transfer. Since 45% of UC Transfers choose campus within 50 miles of their home including 77% for UCI and a low of 16% for UC Santa Barbara³² (this suggests a more significant barrier for those students that live farther away. Many of our most vulnerable student populations find that moving away to transfer is not a viable option for financial or other reasons. In other cases, students with the biggest financial need find that even if the nearest four-year campus is 25-50 miles away, they lack the reliable transportation necessary to attend, especially in more rural areas where public transportation is not a viable option.

Often campuses have small programs that are successful, especially for traditionally marginalized or underserved groups. Programs such as Puentes and Umoja typically have much higher transfer rates for students in those programs than exist for similar students not in such programs. Many colleges, however, find that the cost of such programs make it difficult to expand them to serve larger numbers of students despite their success serving important populations specifically called out in Title 5 and referred to in the *Vision for Success*.

Despite these challenges, community colleges must find ways to adjust our practices to meet the needs of our students including those seeking to transfer. As we leverage existing resources including adopting more high impact practices, we must seek additional resources as a system to serve our community of students.

Recommendations for Local Senates

Local senates must embrace new transfer partnerships including the UC Transfer Pathways to facilitate the transfer path for students

³¹ <https://ccleague.amza.securityserve.com/sites/default/files/training-materials/PRP50law.pdf>

³² <https://accountability.universityofcalifornia.edu/2016/chapters/chapter-1.html#1.1.3>

Local senates should work with encourage the partnership between discipline faculty, curriculum committees and counseling faculty to create degrees that align with new transfer pathways such as the UC Transfer Pathways.

Recommendations for Colleges

Although local colleges cannot directly affect barriers such as 50% Law to hire significantly more counselors to help facilitate transfers, colleges can leverage the counseling expertise by partnering with discipline experts to reach more students to both encourage pursuit of transfer and provide the information necessary to prepare students. This partnership is particularly useful since counselors have unique expertise regarding transfer infrastructure, but typically can see a student once a semester or less, while discipline faculty often see students several times a week for the entire semester.

Reach out to students that are transfer ready to help them reach their goals.

Colleges need to have counselors that specialize in transfer, including an articulation officer and whenever possible house these experts in a dedicated space that can not only help build and transfer community but can provide space for collaborations with other within the campus community.

Recommendations for the Chancellor's Office

Provide a dedicated and stable funding stream for transfer infrastructure such as transfer centers to increasing the number of students who are transfer ready in accordance with *the Vision for Success*.

The Board of Governors and the Chancellor's Office work with UC and CSU Partners along with legislators to assure that students who are transfer ready have access to a university that is accessible, especially to students who for financial or other reasons are unable to relocate hundreds of miles away.

Colleges need to must embrace the various transfer partnerships including the Pilot UC Transfer degrees. This will require collaboration between local curriculum committees and discipline faculty to create the degrees.

Appendix

Transfer Center Directors Recommended Essential Duties as Outlined in “The California Community College Transfer Center Recommendation Guidelines”

- Serving as the primary contact person for inquiries from community college administrators, faculty, staff, students and the community concerning the college’s transfer programs and services.
- Serving as a liaison between the community college and baccalaureate-level universities in regard to admission policies and transfer requirements.
- Working with campus faculty and administration to ensure that the transfer function is clearly identified as a primary mission of the college. Is the transfer mission clearly articulated in the college’s mission statement and goals? Is transfer information clearly conveyed on the college website and in the college catalog, class schedule, newsletters and brochures? Does the campus provide for adequate transfer facilities and adequately trained staff to ensure a strong and viable transfer program? Are the fiscal needs of the transfer function considered in the budget planning process? Does the college offer a curriculum that supports transfer, and are the lower-division requirements of nearby institution considered in curriculum development?
- Working with college administrators to coordinate the activities of the Transfer Center with other instructional and student services programs on campus and to encourage cooperative working relationships.
- Informing the college’s academic senate of critical transfer initiatives and policy changes, and encouraging the participation of instructional faculty in the development, implementation and evaluation of transfer efforts. Working with instructional faculty to incorporate the transfer function as a part of the syllabus of select courses offered at the community college.
- Establishing and chairing the Transfer Center Advisory Committee developed to assist in supporting and strengthening transfer activities on campus. This committee may include a governing board member, an academic senate representative, instructional and counseling faculty, students, administration, student services and representatives from local universities.
- Working with the campus articulation officer to monitor and encourage the development of articulation agreements and campus participation in articulation efforts.
- Directing the Transfer Center and its budget, and directing the activities of the Transfer Center staff.
- Providing ongoing information and training to counselors and Transfer Center staff regarding new transfer options and policies, changing requirements,

university selection criteria, ASSIST, UC Pathways and university application procedures to ensure that accurate and up-to-date information is being conveyed to students.

- In conjunction with the Counseling Department, providing transfer counseling that supplements the counseling that takes place within the Counseling Department. Transfer Center counseling often includes handling complex transfer cases referred to the Transfer Center by counselors, administrators or instructional faculty; the evaluation of independent and out-of-state transcripts for transfer to UC, CSU or other baccalaureate-level colleges or universities (if applicable, consult with transcript evaluators); research regarding transfer requirements to independent or out-of-state universities; or advocacy for students to educate and empower them in the admission appeal process.
- Receiving daily California Community College and university updates through the statewide Transfer Center Director's distribution list (organized through the CCC Chancellor's Office) and redirecting these updates to counselors, Transfer Center staff, and appropriate administrators and instructional faculty.
- Developing a comprehensive Transfer Center webpage that includes information on in-state and out-of-state public and private universities, and identifying and purchasing resource books and materials that assist students with their research in transitioning from a community college to a university, such as college and university catalogs, university reference guides, scholarship reference guides, college essays and other resource books and published materials.
- Directing the college's TAA or Transfer Admission Agreement (TAG) and ADT programs with universities.
- Providing transfer courses, workshops and classroom presentations that include information about university admission requirements, selection criteria, TAAs and application processes to baccalaureate-level campuses. These classes, workshops and presentations should be provided for all students, including EOPS, DSPS, foster youth, Puente, veterans and Umoja students. Note: All of these programs include large numbers of low-income and first-generation college students.
- Encouraging and participating in campus-wide efforts to identify and remove barriers to the retention and transfer of all students, including low-income, disabled and first-generation college students and other populations identified by the college's Student Equity data and to assist with the efforts of developing strategies to improve the transfer rate for these students.
- In conjunction with regional universities and the Office of Institutional Effectiveness, develop and implement methods to evaluate the effectiveness of local transfer activities.
- Encouraging staff from university admissions offices to participate in Transfer Center activities: to meet regularly with potential transfer students to discuss academic options, evaluate transcripts and assist in planning transfer coursework; to provide transfer and application workshops for students; to

attend Transfer Center Advisory Committee meetings; and to attend annual Transfer Day/College Night programs. University staff have asked that a single location be identified at each community college as their point of contact for all transfer activities.

- Directing the Transfer Center's university tour program.
- Collaborating with other California Community College campuses to obtain information and best practices to develop strong Transfer Center programs and transfer activities.
- Attending regional Transfer Center Directors meetings coordinated by the CCC Chancellor's Office and attending the annual CCC statewide Transfer Center Directors meeting. In addition, attending transfer meetings and conferences sponsored by UC, CSU and independent colleges and universities.
- Collaborating with the Admissions Office/ Enrollment Services/Evaluations Offices to ensure the Associate Degree for Transfer is verified and posted on students' transcripts in a timely manner.
- Writing and submitting the annual Transfer Center Report to the CCC Chancellor's Office.
- Reporting to the college governing board annually on transfer numbers and community college or university trends or policies that are affecting transfer students
- Serving as a member of the statewide Transfer Center Director Association (i.e., WACAC) and participating on the Transfer Advocacy Committee.

Counseling Faculty: Counselors working in the Transfer Center assist the Transfer Center Director with all aspects of the counseling and teaching activities of the center. As stated in the California Community College Transfer Center Recommendation Guideline" the following are essential duties:

- In conjunction with the Counseling Department, providing transfer counseling that supplements the counseling that takes place within the Counseling Department. Transfer Center counseling often includes handling complex transfer cases referred to the Transfer Center by counselors, administrators or instructional faculty; the evaluation of independent and out-of- state transcripts for transfer to UC, CSU or other baccalaureate-level colleges or universities (if applicable, consult with the transcript evaluators); research regarding transfer requirements to independent or out-of-state universities; or advocacy for students to educate and empower them in the admission appeal process .
- Checking TAAs for completion and accuracy prior to sending them to the universities for approval. Assisting in reviewing the ADTs for the purposes of meeting the requirements for the degree and similar majors at the receiving institution.
- Providing transfer courses, workshops and classroom presentations that include information about university admission requirements, selection criteria, TAAs and application processes to baccalaureate-level campuses. These classes, workshops and presentations should be provided for all students and include

special programs that serve low-income, disabled and first-generation college students, veterans, foster youth, and other populations identified by the college's Student Equity data.

- Encouraging and participating in campus-wide efforts to identify and remove barriers to the retention and transfer of low-income, disabled and first-generation college students and other populations identified by the college's Student Equity data. Assisting in campus-wide efforts to develop strategies to improve the transfer rate for these students.
- Organizing campus tours to baccalaureate-level colleges and universities and assisting with the coordination of Transfer Day/College Night.
- Assisting in the creation and operation of technology-enhanced transfer counseling, i.e., online chats with university representatives for transfer students.

Recommended Essential Duties for Classified Staff as Outlined in “The California Community College Transfer Center Recommendation Guidelines”

- Working at the front line of the Transfer Center to greet students, answer student transfer questions and refer students to Transfer Center counselors or to the Counseling Department as appropriate.
- Publishing a calendar (both online and in print) of Transfer Center activities to inform students and the campus community of ongoing transfer activities taking place on campus.
- Assisting students with transfer research using both online and print resources.
- Assisting students with university applications.
- Monitoring and tracking all incoming and outgoing TAAs, which includes maintaining a database of mailed/approved/denied TAAs and notifying students and counseling faculty of TAA status.
- Developing communication tools to publicize Transfer Center activities to the campus, including posters, social media and any tools used on campus to promote activities.
- Scheduling appointments for visiting university representatives and Transfer Center counselors.
- Ordering and maintaining all transfer resource books and materials.
- Handling all clerical support for the Transfer Center Director and Transfer Center Counselors.
- Supervising student employees.
- Chaperoning with the University transfer tours.
- Assisting with maintaining and updating the Transfer Center webpage

The Associate Degrees for Transfer Approved as of Fall 2019

- Administration of Justice
- Agriculture Animal Science
- Agriculture Business
- Agriculture Plant Sciences
- Anthropology
- Art history
- Biology
- Business Administration
- Chemistry
- Child and Adolescent Development
- Communication Studies
- Computer Sciences
- Early Childhood Education
- Economics
- Elementary Children Education
- English
- Environmental Science
- Film, Television, and Electronic Media
- Geography
- Geology
- Global Studies
- History
- Hospitality Management
- Journalism
- Kinesiology
- Law, Public Policy and Society
- Mathematics
- Music
- Nutrition and Dietetics
- Philosophy
- Physics
- Political Science
- Psychology
- Public Health Science
- Social Justice Studies
- Social Work and Human Services
- Sociology
- Spanish
- Studio Arts
- Theatre Arts

The Twenty One Majors in the UC Transfer Pathways

- Anthropology
- Biochemistry
- Biology
- Business administration
- Cell biology
- Chemistry
- Communication
- Computer science
- Economics
- Electrical engineering
- English
- History
- Mathematics
- Mechanical engineering
- Molecular biology
- Philosophy
- Physics
- Political science
- Psychology
- Sociology

The Majors in the UC Pathways+

- Anthropology
- Biochemistry
- Biology
- Business administration
- Cell biology
- Chemistry
- Communication
- Computer science
- Economics
- Electrical engineering
- English
- History
- Mathematics
- Mechanical engineering
- Molecular biology
- Philosophy
- Physics
- Political science
- Psychology
- Sociology